Shade Under Scrutiny

Weigh a data table, public comments, and a supplier claim.

11-12.SL.2 "Integrate multiple sources of information when presenting. Evaluate information presented in diverse media or formats (e.g., visually, quantitatively, orally) in order to make informed decisions and solve problems..."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline two claims that the table supports or challenges, circle a limit of each source, and number the sources you would check before recommending a bus stop for shade.

Which Stop Needs Shade?

(1) A neighborhood council can fund shade at only one bus stop this summer. On a Tuesday in July, city staff used the same infrared thermometer at noon to measure pavement at three stops. Student volunteers counted riders during the same twenty minutes. The table shows their results. Pavement temperature is not the same as air temperature.

TUESDAY IN JULY: NOON BUS STOP OBSERVATIONS

Stop	Pavement temperature (°F)	Riders in 20 minutes
Library	112	24
Stadium	119	9
Clinic	105	17

(2) At a public meeting, a bus driver said, "The Stadium stop is packed after games; people wait in full sun." Her firsthand account describes times the table did not sample. A resident posted that the Library stop is "always the hottest," but gave no measurements. The city's single-day figures challenge that claim, though they cannot describe every day.

(3) A shade supplier's flyer promises its canopy can lower pavement temperature by "up to 20°F," but lists neither test conditions nor independent results. The council must weigh the Stadium's hotter pavement against the Library's higher midday rider count. Before choosing, members could request game-day counts and independently measured cooling data, then explain which evidence supports their decision.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. How does the table challenge the resident's claim about the Library stop? Explain what the table cannot establish.

2. The driver calls the Stadium stop packed, but its rider count is the lowest in the table. Why might both sources be accurate?

3. What makes the supplier's cooling claim difficult to verify, and what evidence would make it more credible?

4. If the council must decide using only the evidence shown, which stop would you prioritize? Support your choice with two table values and acknowledge one limit of that evidence.

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Write a brief plan for the council's next two weeks of research. Use the table and one other source in the passage, explain a difference between what they show, propose a way to check the evidence, and state how the results would guide the shade decision.

ANSWER KEY

Shade Under Scrutiny

HIGH SCHOOL · 11-12.SL.2

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline two claims that the table supports or challenges, circle a limit of each source, and number the sources you would check before recommending a bus stop for shade. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	How does the table challenge the resident's claim about the Library stop? Explain what the table cannot establish.	**The Stadium pavement measured 119°F, compared with 112°F at the Library, so the Library was not the hottest stop measured that Tuesday. One day of measurements cannot show which stop is hottest on other days.**
2	The driver calls the Stadium stop packed, but its rider count is the lowest in the table. Why might both sources be accurate?	**The table counts riders during twenty minutes near noon on a Tuesday. The driver describes crowds after games, which the count did not cover.**
3	What makes the supplier's cooling claim difficult to verify, and what evidence would make it more credible?	**The flyer gives no test conditions or independent results. Measurements by an independent tester, with conditions and a comparison surface reported, would help verify it.**
4	If the council must decide using only the evidence shown, which stop would you prioritize? Support your choice with two table values and acknowledge one limit of that evidence.	**Accept Library, supported by 24 riders compared with Stadium's 9, or Stadium, supported by 119°F pavement compared with Library's 112°F. The response must note that the table covers only one twenty-minute period on one day.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

The table shows 24 riders at the Library stop but only 9 at Stadium during the noon count. The bus driver reports crowds at Stadium after games, a time the table misses. For two weeks, volunteers should count riders at both stops at noon and after each Stadium game, using the same twenty-minute counting period. City staff should also measure pavement temperatures at set times with the same thermometer. The council could prioritize the stop with the greatest repeated exposure to hot pavement, rather than relying on one noon count.

Accept either stop in question 4 when the cited values support the choice and the response identifies the sample's limit. For the open task, look for a workable check of the sources, not a predetermined choice of stop.