Two Sides, One Claim

Main claim: Harbor City should require all new public buses to be electric by 2035.

11-12.WHST.1.a "Introduce precise claim(s), distinguish the claim(s) from alternate or opposing claims, and create an organization that establishes clear relationships among the claim(s), counterclaims, reasons, and evidence."

NAME _____ DATE _____

ALIGNED CLAIM

An aligned claim takes the same position as the main claim. Its reason and evidence help make the case for that position.

Main claim: The library should open on Sundays.
Aligned claim: It should add Sunday hours because weekday workers need access.

COUNTERCLAIM

A counterclaim argues against the main claim or proposes a different choice. Its reason and evidence help make the case for that alternative.

Main claim: The library should open on Sundays.
Counterclaim: It should stay closed Sundays because extra shifts would increase staffing costs.

1 SORT

8 items

Part 1: Circle ALIGNED or OPPOSING for each numbered claim; Part 2: Choose one item from each category and explain how its evidence supports its reason and how that reason supports or challenges the main claim.

1.	Require electric buses by 2035 because cleaner air at stops matters; electric buses have no tailpipe emissions.	ALIGNED OPPOSING
2.	Keep diesel buses as an option after 2035 because charging could limit service; electric buses must recharge.	ALIGNED OPPOSING
3.	Postpone the requirement because cold-weather reliability matters; battery range can decrease in low temperatures.	ALIGNED OPPOSING
4.	Adopt the requirement because quieter streets benefit residents; electric motors generally make less noise than diesel engines.	ALIGNED OPPOSING
5.	Adopt the requirement because charging can be planned around service; public buses follow scheduled routes.	ALIGNED OPPOSING
6.	Require electric buses by 2035 to reduce diesel use; electric buses run on electricity rather than diesel.	ALIGNED OPPOSING
7.	Allow diesel purchases beyond 2035 because routes need flexibility; charging an electric bus takes time.	ALIGNED OPPOSING
8.	Adopt the requirement to reduce street-level soot; diesel exhaust contains particulate matter.	ALIGNED OPPOSING

2 PROVE IT

Explain your thinking

Pick two items from Part 1. For each one, tell how you knew where it belonged.

ITEM # _____ **HOW I KNEW** _____

ITEM # _____ **HOW I KNEW** _____

3 MAKE YOUR OWN

One of each

Part 3: Write one new aligned claim and one new counterclaim about Harbor City's bus requirement. Give each claim a reason and a piece of evidence.

ALIGNED _____

OPPOSING _____

CHALLENGE

Write a four-sentence argument. State the main claim, connect one aligned item to its reason and evidence, present one opposing item with its reason and evidence, then explain why the opposing evidence does not cancel the benefit you identified.

ANSWER KEY

Two Sides, One Claim

HIGH SCHOOL · 11-12.WHST.1.a

PART 1 · SORT

#	ITEM	CATEGORY	WHY
1	Require electric buses by 2035 because cleaner air at stops matters; electric buses have no tailpipe emissions.	**ALIGNED**	The position favors the requirement, and the tailpipe fact supports its air-quality reason.
2	Keep diesel buses as an option after 2035 because charging could limit service; electric buses must recharge.	**OPPOSING**	Keeping diesel purchases available conflicts with the requirement; recharging supports the service concern.
3	Postpone the requirement because cold-weather reliability matters; battery range can decrease in low temperatures.	**OPPOSING**	Postponement opposes the 2035 deadline, and reduced range supports the reliability concern.
4	Adopt the requirement because quieter streets benefit residents; electric motors generally make less noise than diesel engines.	**ALIGNED**	The position favors the requirement, and the noise comparison supports its reason.
5	Adopt the requirement because charging can be planned around service; public buses follow scheduled routes.	**ALIGNED**	The position favors the requirement, and scheduled routes support the possibility of planning charging.
6	Require electric buses by 2035 to reduce diesel use; electric buses run on electricity rather than diesel.	**ALIGNED**	The position favors the requirement, and the fuel difference supports its reason.
7	Allow diesel purchases beyond 2035 because routes need flexibility; charging an electric bus takes time.	**OPPOSING**	Allowing diesel purchases conflicts with the requirement, and charging time supports the flexibility concern.
8	Adopt the requirement to reduce street-level soot; diesel exhaust contains particulate matter.	**ALIGNED**	The position favors the requirement, and particulate matter in diesel exhaust supports its reason.

PART 2 · PROVE IT

Accept any explanation that names the deciding feature from the rule box for the chosen item.

PART 3 · MAKE YOUR OWN (SAMPLE ANSWERS)

- **ALIGNED**: Adopt the requirement because recovering energy could improve efficiency; many electric buses use regenerative braking.
- **OPPOSING**: Reject the 2035 deadline because the change requires depot work; buses need access to chargers before they can recharge there.

Challenge: Harbor City should require all new public buses to be electric by 2035. Because electric buses have no tailpipe emissions, the requirement would reduce exhaust near riders. Opponents argue for postponement because battery range can decrease in cold weather, which could put service at risk. That range concern calls for route planning, but it does not cancel the benefit of removing tailpipe exhaust.

The sort sequence is ALIGNED, OPPOSING, OPPOSING, ALIGNED, ALIGNED, ALIGNED, OPPOSING, ALIGNED. For Part 2, look for an explanation of the link from evidence to reason and from reason to the main claim or counterclaim, not just a restatement of the label.