One Garden, Two Views

Compare a firsthand account with a later report.

4.RI.6 "Compare and contrast a primary and secondary account of the same event or topic; describe the similarities/differences in the point of view based on the information provided."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline two facts that appear in both accounts. Circle one detail Maya noticed firsthand, and put a 1 beside one detail the newsletter adds about the garden's future.

Planting the Rain Garden

1. From Maya's journal, written Saturday: This morning, our fourth-grade class planted a rain garden beside the playground. I knelt in damp soil while Leo passed me small flowering plants. The soil stuck to my fingers, and someone laughed when a worm curled across my glove. We set the plants in shallow holes, pressed soil around them, and carried watering cans from the tap.

2. At first, I wondered why we were making a garden in a spot that gets puddles. Ms. Chen said the plants and soil would help soak up rainwater. After we watered the last plant, I stepped back and saw a curved row of green leaves. My knees were muddy, but I wanted to bring my family to see what we had made.

3. From the school newsletter, written a week later by a student who was not at the planting: Fourth graders planted a rain garden beside the playground on Saturday morning. According to Ms. Chen, the class chose the low spot because water often collects there. The new plants and soil can absorb some rainwater. The class planted flowering plants and watered them. The school plans to check how well the garden handles puddles after future storms.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. Which account is firsthand? What in the passage shows that its writer was there, unlike the newsletter writer?

2. Name two facts about the planting that both accounts give.

3. How does Maya's account show what the planting felt like in a way the newsletter does not?

4. What does the newsletter tell about the garden's future that Maya does not? How does this fit the newsletter writer's point of view?

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Imagine you watched the planting from the library window. Write four sentences as that student: include one fact both accounts share, add one plausible sight or sound not in either account, and compare what you would know firsthand with what the newsletter writer learned later.

ANSWER KEY

One Garden, Two Views

GRADE 4 · 4.RI.6

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline two facts that appear in both accounts. Circle one detail Maya noticed firsthand, and put a 1 beside one detail the newsletter adds about the garden's future. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	Which account is firsthand? What in the passage shows that its writer was there, unlike the newsletter writer?	**Maya's journal is firsthand. She describes kneeling in the soil and getting mud on her knees. The newsletter says its writer was not at the planting.**
2	Name two facts about the planting that both accounts give.	**Both say fourth graders planted a rain garden beside the playground and watered the plants.**
3	How does Maya's account show what the planting felt like in a way the newsletter does not?	**Maya describes soil sticking to her fingers and mud on her knees. The newsletter reports what the class did without describing those firsthand feelings.**
4	What does the newsletter tell about the garden's future that Maya does not? How does this fit the newsletter writer's point of view?	**The school plans to check for puddles after future storms. The newsletter writer reports the school's plan, while Maya writes about her experience planting.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

From the library window, I watched fourth graders plant a rain garden beside the playground on Saturday morning. I saw a red watering can tip and splash someone's shoes. Because I was there, I could describe that small moment. The newsletter writer was not there and used information from Ms. Chen instead.

Accept any two facts clearly stated in both accounts for question 2. For Your Turn, accept a plausible invented observation if the response distinguishes watching the event from reporting information learned later.