A Stronger Claim

Trace how feedback changes a science report.

6-8.WHST.5 "Develop and strengthen writing as needed. Employ the writing process by planning, drafting, revising, editing, rewriting, or trying a new approach. Use guidance and support from peers, adults, and digital editing tools/platforms."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline Nia's first claim and circle the two comments she received. Number the four changes she made to the report's ideas or organization in the order they appear.

Nia Revises Her Report

1. In science class, Nia investigated whether a layer of straw slows water loss from soil. She filled two identical cups with equal amounts of dry soil and poured the same amount of water into each. She covered one cup with straw and left the other bare. After two days, the covered cup had lost 18 grams of mass; the bare cup had lost 31 grams. Nia planned a report with three parts: question, method, and results. Her first draft ended, "Straw always stops soil from drying out."

2. A classmate circled the word "always" and asked, "Can two cups prove what happens every time?" Nia agreed that one trial could not support such a broad claim. She replaced her ending with, "In this two-day test, the cup with straw lost 13 grams less mass than the bare cup." Then she noticed another gap: readers could not tell whether the cups had been left in the same place. She added a method sentence explaining that both cups sat on the same windowsill. Her revision changed the claim and filled in a missing detail.

3. Nia's teacher read the new draft and pointed out that "lost mass" did not explain what the measurement might mean. Nia rewrote the results section to say that the difference was consistent with less water leaving the covered cup, but she could not rule out other causes with only one trial. She also tried a new approach: placing the numbers before her explanation so readers could check her reasoning. Finally, she used a digital spell-checker to catch "mesurement," then checked the suggestion against her notes before changing it to "measurement."

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. Which part of Nia's plan did she revise after her classmate questioned her claim? What was wrong with the first claim?

2. How did Nia make her new claim more precise? Name two changes.

3. What did Nia add to her method, and what question would that answer for a reader?

4. What new order did Nia try after her teacher's comment? How could it help readers?

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Revise this mini-draft in three sentences using the numbers, a claim limited to this test, and one method detail you would check rather than invent: “Brand A is the best. In one test, it absorbed 24 mL of water, and Brand B absorbed 20 mL.” A partner says the claim is too broad, and your teacher wants a clearer method.

ANSWER KEY

A Stronger Claim

GRADES 6-8 · 6-8.WHST.5

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline Nia's first claim and circle the two comments she received. Number the four changes she made to the report's ideas or organization in the order they appear. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	Which part of Nia's plan did she revise after her classmate questioned her claim? What was wrong with the first claim?	**She revised the results, especially the ending claim. One trial with two cups could not show that straw always stops soil from drying out.**
2	How did Nia make her new claim more precise? Name two changes.	**She limited it to the two-day test and stated that the covered cup lost 13 grams less mass.**
3	What did Nia add to her method, and what question would that answer for a reader?	**She added that both cups sat on the same windowsill. This tells readers whether the cups were left in the same place.**
4	What new order did Nia try after her teacher's comment? How could it help readers?	**She put the numbers before her explanation so readers could check whether the evidence supported her reasoning.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

In one test, Brand A absorbed 24 mL of water, while Brand B absorbed 20 mL. In that test, Brand A absorbed 4 mL more, but one test does not show which brand is best overall. I would check my notes for how long each towel touched the water, then add that detail to the method.

For the marking job, accept Nia's revised claim, added windowsill detail, rewritten results explanation, and reordered numbers as the four changes. The spell-check correction is an edit, not a change to ideas or organization.