Library at Lunch

Trace a proposal, then test its evidence

7.RI.8 "Trace and evaluate the argument and specific claims in a text. Assess whether the reasoning is sound. Assess whether the evidence is relevant and sufficient to support the claims."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline the council's proposal, circle two pieces of evidence that support it, and number two limits of the evidence. Use your marks to judge how strong the argument is.

Should the Library Open at Lunch?

1. At Cedar Middle School, the library closes during lunch, even though some students need it then. The student council argues that the school should test opening it two lunches each week for four weeks. Council members stood outside the locked library on four Tuesdays and counted 18 students who asked to go in. Eleven wanted to borrow or return books, while seven wanted a quiet place to work. Those requests suggest that a lunchtime opening could meet a real need, but four Tuesdays cannot show what happens every day.

2. The council also points to a small trial last spring. On two Wednesdays, a librarian opened the room during lunch and counted 24 visits on the first day and 27 on the second. Eight books were borrowed each day. This evidence shows that students used the library when it opened, and book borrowing was part of that use. However, the count includes repeat visitors, so it does not tell us how many different students came. It also does not show whether students read more after the trial.

3. Some teachers worry that opening the library would take an adult away from other lunch duties. The council suggests asking student volunteers to help check out books, but volunteers cannot replace the adult required to supervise the room. Before making a permanent schedule, the school should ask whether a staff member is available for a four-week trial. During the trial, the council could count visits, book loans, and students using the room to work. These records would help the school judge demand, although they would not measure reading improvement.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. What is the council's main proposal? How do the requests counted on Tuesdays support it?

2. Do the numbers from the two-day trial support a claim that students read more? Explain what those numbers do show.

3. Are the requests counted on four Tuesdays enough to predict demand on every lunch day? Why or why not?

4. Does the plan to use student volunteers answer the teachers' concern about supervision? Explain.

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Write a three- or four-sentence recommendation about which service the library should prioritize during a trial: book borrowing or a quiet place to work. Use two different details from the passage and explain one limit of the evidence.

Library at Lunch

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline the council's proposal, circle two pieces of evidence that support it, and number two limits of the evidence. Use your marks to judge how strong the argument is. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What is the council's main proposal? How do the requests counted on Tuesdays support it?	**The council proposes opening the library for lunch twice a week for four weeks. The 18 requests to enter on four Tuesdays suggest some students would use it.**
2	Do the numbers from the two-day trial support a claim that students read more? Explain what those numbers do show.	**No. The visits and book loans show that students used the library, but they do not show whether students read more.**
3	Are the requests counted on four Tuesdays enough to predict demand on every lunch day? Why or why not?	**No. The count shows demand on those four Tuesdays, but demand on other days might differ.**
4	Does the plan to use student volunteers answer the teachers' concern about supervision? Explain.	**No. Volunteers could help check out books, but an adult would still need to supervise the room.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

The library should prioritize book borrowing during the trial. On four Tuesdays, 11 students asked to borrow or return books, compared with seven who wanted a quiet place to work. During the two-day opening, eight books were borrowed each day. However, these few days do not show whether borrowing would stay steady throughout the trial.

Accept either service as the priority if the recommendation uses two accurate passage details and identifies a genuine limit of the evidence. Students may note that the counts cover few days or that visits may include repeat visitors.