Count the Evidence

Check what each source can actually prove

7.W.8.b "Assess the credibility and accuracy of each source."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Circle the three sources, underline one detail that helps you judge each source, and number two details that warn you against treating a claim as proven.

Did the Stations Cut Waste?

1. For a school newspaper story, Maya is checking whether refill stations have reduced plastic bottle waste at Ridgeview Middle School. The facilities office gave her a dated report from station sensors: 18,200 fills in September and 20,100 in October. A staff member explained that each number records a completed filling cycle, not a bottle thrown away or saved. The office maintains the stations and can explain how the count is made. Maya can use the report to describe station use, but she cannot turn fills into bottles avoided.

2. A post from FlowFresh, the company that sells the stations, declares, "Ridgeview eliminated 20,100 plastic bottles in October!" It links to the facilities report but offers no count of bottles thrown away. FlowFresh names no researcher who checked whether each fill replaced a disposable bottle. The company may benefit if readers believe its stations prevent more waste than they do. Maya notices that the post repeats an accurate number while changing what the number means. She decides not to quote its waste claim as a fact.

3. Another source is Leo, a student who counted bottles in the same cafeteria trash bin at 12:30 p.m. on two Tuesdays. He recorded 42 bottles on September 15 and 29 on October 13, and he kept his tally sheets. Maya can check his method and numbers. Still, one bin on two days does not represent every bin or every day. Leo did not measure how many students ate lunch on either date. His count suggests a question worth investigating, not proof that stations caused a schoolwide drop in bottle waste.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. Why is the facilities report a useful source for the number of station fills, but not for the number of bottles saved?

2. FlowFresh uses a number from the report. What makes its waste claim inaccurate, and why should Maya consider the company's interest in that claim?

3. What makes Leo's counts possible to check, and what limits their usefulness?

4. Could Maya accurately report that the stations caused a schoolwide drop in bottle waste? Use evidence from both the facilities report and Leo's count.

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Write four or five sentences proposing a new, testable claim about when or how students use the refill stations. Name two sources you would check, explain what each could tell you, and describe a result that would make you revise your claim.

ANSWER KEY

Count the Evidence

GRADE 7 · 7.W.8.b

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Circle the three sources, underline one detail that helps you judge each source, and number two details that warn you against treating a claim as proven. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	Why is the facilities report a useful source for the number of station fills, but not for the number of bottles saved?	**The facilities office maintains the stations and explains how its sensors count fills. The sensors do not count bottles thrown away or saved.**
2	FlowFresh uses a number from the report. What makes its waste claim inaccurate, and why should Maya consider the company's interest in that claim?	**FlowFresh treats 20,100 fills as 20,100 bottles eliminated without checking whether each fill replaced a disposable bottle. The company sells the stations and may benefit from an impressive waste claim.**
3	What makes Leo's counts possible to check, and what limits their usefulness?	**Leo recorded the time, dates, and bin and kept tally sheets. He counted only one bin on two days and did not record lunch attendance.**
4	Could Maya accurately report that the stations caused a schoolwide drop in bottle waste? Use evidence from both the facilities report and Leo's count.	**No. The report shows more fills in October but does not count bottles saved. Leo found fewer bottles in one bin on one October day, which cannot establish a schoolwide change or its cause.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

I think most station fills happen during lunch. I would ask the facilities office for sensor records that show the time of each fill and the school office for the lunch schedule. Comparing those sources would show how many fills happened during lunch, though the records would not show who used the stations. I would revise my claim if half or fewer of the fills happened during lunch.

Accept answers that distinguish what a source directly records from what someone claims it proves. For the open task, accept other testable claims with two relevant sources, a clear limit on the evidence, and a result that could change the student's view.