Evidence at Lunch

Read a school proposal and weigh its support.

8.RI.8.b "Assess whether the evidence is relevant and sufficient."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline evidence that relates to a claim about opening the library at lunch, circle evidence that does not relate, and put a question mark beside any claim that needs more evidence.

Should the Library Open at Lunch?

1 Our school should open the library during lunch at least twice a week. Right now, its doors stay locked until the last lunch period ends. On three days in September, a student volunteer counted classmates who tried the library door: 14 on Monday, 17 on Wednesday, and 12 on Friday. The volunteer did not record names, so some students may appear more than once. These counts suggest that students want another place to spend lunch, even if they do not show how many different students would visit regularly.

2 A lunchtime library could also give students a quieter place to read or finish assignments. In a poll of 28 members of the after-school book club, 23 said they would use the library at lunch. The poll did not ask students outside the club. A parent group recently donated 60 mystery novels to the library, and the school's chess team won a regional match last spring. Together, these details make lunchtime access sound like a welcome change, but the school needs to decide which details actually support the proposal.

3 Some supporters say opening the library would solve crowding in the cafeteria. On one Tuesday, a lunch monitor counted 174 students in a room with 180 seats. That count shows seats were nearly full on that day, but no one counted how many students would leave the cafeteria for the library. A trial would also require an adult to supervise the library, and no staff schedule has been checked. Before changing the schedule for the whole year, the school could try two lunch days and record visits, seating, and supervision needs.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. Are the counts at the library door relevant to the proposal? Are they sufficient to show that students would visit regularly? Explain both judgments.

2. Does the book club poll provide sufficient evidence that students across the school want lunchtime library access? Explain.

3. Is the chess team's regional win relevant to the proposal? Explain why or why not.

4. Does the cafeteria count sufficiently support the claim that opening the library would solve crowding? Explain.

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

A student claims that opening the library at lunch would help students finish assignments. Write three sentences that name evidence you would collect, explain why it is relevant, and describe a comparison that would make the claim better supported.

ANSWER KEY

Evidence at Lunch

GRADE 8 · 8.RI.8.b

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline evidence that relates to a claim about opening the library at lunch, circle evidence that does not relate, and put a question mark beside any claim that needs more evidence. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	Are the counts at the library door relevant to the proposal? Are they sufficient to show that students would visit regularly? Explain both judgments.	**The counts are relevant because students tried to enter during lunch. They are not sufficient to show regular use because they cover only three days and may count the same students more than once.**
2	Does the book club poll provide sufficient evidence that students across the school want lunchtime library access? Explain.	**No. It shows interest among book club members, but students outside the club were not asked.**
3	Is the chess team's regional win relevant to the proposal? Explain why or why not.	**No. A chess win does not show whether students would use the library at lunch or benefit from it.**
4	Does the cafeteria count sufficiently support the claim that opening the library would solve crowding? Explain.	**No. The count shows that seats were nearly full on one day, but it does not show how many students would move to the library or whether crowding happens regularly.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

I would record how many students use the library at lunch to finish an assignment during a two-week trial. This evidence is relevant because it tracks the activity named in the claim rather than just visits to the library. I would compare those students' assignment completion during the trial with their completion during two earlier weeks to see whether it improved.

Accept other well-explained judgments that distinguish evidence related to a claim from evidence strong enough to support it. For the open task, accept a specific measure of assignment completion and a comparison that could test for improvement.