Shade or Charge?

Test the evidence behind a city spending proposal.

9-10.RI.8.a "Assess whether the reasoning is valid, and the evidence is relevant and sufficient."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline the recommendation about what the city should buy first, then circle one detail supporting shade and one supporting charging. Put a question mark beside a claim that reaches beyond its evidence.

What Should Come First at Bus Stops?

1. On a bright August afternoon, a person waiting for a bus can step out of direct sun only by leaving the stop. A roof would block some sunlight while leaving the air around the rider much the same temperature. Our city should install shade at its busiest unsheltered stops before it buys phone-charging stations for those stops. Reducing sun exposure during a long wait is a stronger public need than supplying extra battery power. This proposal does not require a roof at every stop: narrow sidewalks and existing trees may make other solutions more practical.

2. Last summer, I visited three unsheltered stops near the downtown library on one hot afternoon. At each stop, riders stood in the shadow of nearby buildings when they could, even when the shadow was several steps from the posted bus sign. That behavior suggests shade matters to some riders, but three stops on one afternoon cannot show how often riders seek shade across the city. A roof also needs enough sidewalk space for people using wheelchairs to pass. The library's blue roof looks attractive, but its color tells us nothing about which bus improvement should come first.

3. Supporters of charging stations point out that riders use phones to check arrival times and contact family. That is a real reason to consider charging, especially where waits are long. Yet a dead battery does not expose someone to direct sun, so charging alone cannot solve the heat problem. Because riders at the three stops moved toward shade, some residents argue that every stop needs a roof and that roofs will cool the surrounding air. The observation supports neither conclusion. Before setting a citywide budget, officials should count riders at different stops, check sidewalk widths, and ask riders which problems they face most often.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. How does the fact that a roof blocks sunlight support the writer's recommendation? Does that fact alone prove shade should come before charging?

2. Is the color of the library's roof relevant evidence for deciding which bus-stop improvement to buy first? Explain.

3. Are the observations at three stops on one afternoon sufficient to set priorities for all city stops? Explain what is missing.

4. Some residents say roofs will cool the surrounding air because riders moved toward shade. Is that reasoning valid? Explain.

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Imagine the city can afford one pilot project: shade or charging at a busy stop. Recommend one, weigh a relevant reason for each option, and propose a way to check whether your choice meets riders' needs.

ANSWER KEY

Shade or Charge?

HIGH SCHOOL · 9-10.RI.8.a

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline the recommendation about what the city should buy first, then circle one detail supporting shade and one supporting charging. Put a question mark beside a claim that reaches beyond its evidence. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	How does the fact that a roof blocks sunlight support the writer's recommendation? Does that fact alone prove shade should come before charging?	**Blocking sunlight is relevant because the recommendation aims to reduce riders' sun exposure. It does not prove shade should come first because it does not establish riders' needs across the city.**
2	Is the color of the library's roof relevant evidence for deciding which bus-stop improvement to buy first? Explain.	**No. Its color does not show whether riders need shade or charging more.**
3	Are the observations at three stops on one afternoon sufficient to set priorities for all city stops? Explain what is missing.	**No. The observations cover too few stops and too little time. The city needs evidence from other stops and conditions.**
4	Some residents say roofs will cool the surrounding air because riders moved toward shade. Is that reasoning valid? Explain.	**No. Moving toward shade suggests riders wanted to avoid direct sun, not that a roof would lower the surrounding air temperature.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

I would test shade at a busy unsheltered stop. Riders at three stops moved toward shadow, which suggests shade may help, but the passage does not show what riders at other stops need. Charging matters too because people use phones to check arrival times and contact family. I would ask riders about both needs before the pilot and after the roof is installed, then compare their responses.

Accept answers that distinguish relevant evidence from sufficient evidence and explain why seeking shade does not prove a change in air temperature. For Part 3, accept either pilot choice if the student weighs both options and proposes a useful way to test the choice.