Paving or Planting?

Trace the connections in a model argument

9-10.W.1.c "Use appropriate and varied transitional words, phrases, and clauses to link the major sections of the text, create cohesion, and clarify the relationships between claim(s) and reasons, between reasons and evidence..."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Circle words and phrases that connect major sections, reasons, evidence, and opposing views. Underline the main claim and the counterclaim so you can see what those connections link.

A Garden in the Courtyard

1. After a storm, water often pools beside the paved courtyard at a school. The puddles are more than an annoyance: rain that cannot soak through pavement flows toward drains, carrying dirt and litter with it. Our school should replace one corner of the courtyard with a rain garden, a shallow planted area designed to catch runoff. The change would give stormwater a place to soak into soil instead of rushing across concrete. Just as important, students could study how the garden changes after a storm. A small patch of ground could serve both the campus and its science classes.

2. First, a rain garden could keep some runoff from spreading across the courtyard. According to the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, these gardens collect water from hard surfaces and let it soak into the ground. This evidence matters because pavement, unlike planted soil, gives rain little room to enter. Moreover, a garden would offer students a way to test the claim on their own campus. They could track how much water reaches a nearby drain during similar storms before and after planting. Their observations would test whether the change makes a noticeable difference locally.

3. Critics may object that removing pavement means losing space where students gather. That concern deserves attention, especially when the courtyard is crowded at lunch. However, the proposal targets only one corner, leaving most of the paved area open. A marked path beside the garden would also keep students from stepping into wet soil. Still, the school would need a plan for weeding and for clearing litter after storms; plants cannot maintain themselves. Ultimately, these limits argue for a modest, cared-for garden rather than no garden at all. By starting small, the school can protect gathering space while testing a practical approach to runoff.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. How does “First” at the start of paragraph 2 connect that paragraph to the claim in paragraph 1?

2. How does “This evidence matters because” connect the EPA information to the first reason in paragraph 2?

3. What relationship does “However” signal between the critics’ concern and the writer’s response?

4. Near the end, what different purposes do “Still” and “Ultimately” serve?

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Write 4 to 5 sentences arguing for or against adding a water-bottle refill station at school. State a claim, support it with a reason and a concrete example, then acknowledge and respond to a counterclaim; use at least three different transitions to show how your ideas connect.

ANSWER KEY

Paving or Planting?

HIGH SCHOOL · 9-10.W.1.c

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Circle words and phrases that connect major sections, reasons, evidence, and opposing views. Underline the main claim and the counterclaim so you can see what those connections link. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	How does "First" at the start of paragraph 2 connect that paragraph to the claim in paragraph 1?	**It introduces the first reason to replace part of the courtyard with a rain garden: the garden could keep some runoff from spreading.**
2	How does "This evidence matters because" connect the EPA information to the first reason in paragraph 2?	**It explains why the EPA information supports the runoff reason: water can soak into a garden, while pavement gives it little room to enter.**
3	What relationship does "However" signal between the critics' concern and the writer's response?	**It signals a response to the concern about lost gathering space: using only one corner would leave most of the pavement open.**
4	Near the end, what different purposes do "Still" and "Ultimately" serve?	**"Still" introduces the need for maintenance despite the proposal's benefits. "Ultimately" moves to the conclusion that those limits call for a small, cared-for garden rather than no garden.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

Our school should install a water-bottle refill station near the gym. First, it would give students a convenient way to refill bottles after practice. For example, a player whose bottle runs empty could refill it without buying another drink. Some people may argue that cleaning the station would take extra work. However, placing it beside an existing water fountain would let staff check both fixtures during regular rounds.

For the marking job, accept transitions such as "Just as important," "First," "Moreover," "However," "Still," and "Ultimately." In Part 3, accept either position if the transitions clearly link the claim, reason, example, counterclaim, and response.