Shade and Sources

Test what each source can support in a school proposal.

9-10.W.8.b "Assess the relevance, accuracy, and credibility of each source."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline one detail showing what each source can help establish, and circle one detail that limits it. Number the three sources from most to least useful for Maya's claim about making lunch in the courtyard more comfortable.

A Proposal for the Courtyard

1. At Harborview High, students are asking the school board to install a shade sail over the asphalt courtyard. In her proposal, Maya wants to claim that shade will make the courtyard more comfortable during lunch. She finds a July 2025 temperature log posted by the city public works department. The log names the measuring device and time: at noon, pavement in sun reached 112°F, while nearby pavement under a canopy reached 92°F. Both readings were taken in a city park, not on school grounds. The log records pavement surface temperatures, not air temperatures.

2. A company that sells shade sails offers a second source: a product page headed "Cool Your Campus." It states, "A shade sail lowers the air temperature by 20°F," and links to the city's log as proof. The page does not describe an air temperature test, and it does not say whether results vary by location or season. A sales manager's name appears below the claim, but no independent researcher is identified. The product page includes prices and installation options, which Maya might need for a budget, but its cooling claim is not the same as the measurements in the linked log.

3. Finally, Maya reads a student council survey from a single September lunch period. Thirty-two of 48 students who chose to answer said they would use the courtyard more often if it had shade. The council posted the exact question and the number of responses, but it did not explain how many students were invited or whether the volunteers represent the whole school. This survey speaks to student interest, not measured cooling. Maya has room for two sources in her proposal. She must decide which claims each source can support without making the evidence sound stronger than it is.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. How relevant is the city log to Maya's claim about a more comfortable school courtyard? Give one useful detail and one limit.

2. Does the linked city log verify the company's claim about a 20°F drop in air temperature? Explain.

3. How credible is the survey as evidence of what the whole school wants? Use a detail about how responses were collected.

4. For a budget claim, what is the product page relevant to? Why should Maya be cautious about using its cooling claim?

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Write a four-sentence recommendation to Maya. Choose two sources for her proposal, state one claim each can support, explain a limit of one chosen source, and identify one claim she should leave out because the evidence does not support it.

ANSWER KEY

Shade and Sources

HIGH SCHOOL · 9-10.W.8.b

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline one detail showing what each source can help establish, and circle one detail that limits it. Number the three sources from most to least useful for Maya's claim about making lunch in the courtyard more comfortable. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	How relevant is the city log to Maya's claim about a more comfortable school courtyard? Give one useful detail and one limit.	**It shows shaded pavement was cooler than nearby sunlit pavement, but the readings came from a city park in July and measured pavement, not comfort at school.**
2	Does the linked city log verify the company's claim about a 20°F drop in air temperature? Explain.	**No. The log shows a 20°F difference in pavement surface temperature, not air temperature.**
3	How credible is the survey as evidence of what the whole school wants? Use a detail about how responses were collected.	**Its exact question and response count are available, but 48 students chose to answer at one lunch, so their views may not represent the whole school.**
4	For a budget claim, what is the product page relevant to? Why should Maya be cautious about using its cooling claim?	**The page provides prices and installation options. Its cooling claim misstates the linked log's measurements, and the page does not describe an air temperature test.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

Use the city log to support the limited claim that shaded pavement can be cooler than nearby pavement in sun. Use the student council survey to show that 32 of 48 respondents said shade would make them use the courtyard more often. The survey does not show what the entire school thinks because only volunteers at one lunch answered. Leave out the company's claim that a shade sail lowers air temperature by 20°F because the linked log measured pavement, not air.

Accept different source rankings and selections when students distinguish what each source measures or reports from what it cannot establish. The product page can support a budget discussion, but its air temperature claim is not verified by the linked log.