

Shade Stop Debate

Analyze how an argument uses evidence, alternatives, and audience.

7.8 "Multiple genres: listening, speaking, reading, writing, and thinking using multiple texts--genres. The student recognizes and analyzes genre-specific characteristics, structures..."

NAME _____

DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK _____ Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline the claim, circle each piece of evidence or source, and number the concern and response to it 1 and 2. These marks show how the writer builds an argument for a particular audience.

A Shelter for Every Busy Stop?

- ① Riverton should install shade shelters at its busiest bus stops. Many riders wait in direct sun, especially during late-afternoon trips home. A roof does more than make waiting pleasant. It can lower exposure to sunlight and provide a dry place during light rain. The National Weather Service advises people to reduce time in direct sun during hot weather. Shelters would help students, older adults, and workers who depend on buses but cannot choose a cooler waiting place.
- ② Some people may argue that shelters cost too much or block the sidewalk. Those concerns deserve planning, not dismissal. The city could begin with stops that have high ridership and enough sidewalk space, then review the results after one summer. A small pilot would show whether roofs interfere with walking or require frequent repairs. It would also let riders report which designs offer useful shade. Choosing sites carefully is less costly than building shelters where they will not help many people.
- ③ This proposal is aimed at Riverton City Council members, who decide how public funds are used. It asks them to fund a one-summer shelter pilot and to compare rider reports with maintenance costs. For background, the writer consulted National Weather Service heat-safety guidance and local bus ridership maps. Those references allow readers to check the evidence and see why the plan focuses on busy stops instead of every stop.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE _____ Use the passage

1 What is the writer's main claim?

2 What source does the writer use as evidence, and how does it support the claim?

3 What concern about the plan does the writer consider? Explain how the writer responds to that concern.

4 Who is the intended audience? Why does the writer include references to heat-safety guidance and ridership maps?

3 YOUR TURN _____ Your own words

Write an 80 to 100-word proposal to a real school or community decision-maker about one improvement. Include a clear claim, two types of evidence, one alternative concern and response, and a source or acknowledgment readers could check.

PART 1 • READ AND MARK

Underline the claim, circle each piece of evidence or source, and number the concern and response to it 1 and 2. These marks show how the writer builds an argument for a particular audience. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 • ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What is the writer's main claim?	Riverton should install shade shelters at its busiest bus stops.
2	What source does the writer use as evidence, and how does it support the claim?	The writer uses National Weather Service heat-safety guidance. It supports the idea that shelters can reduce riders' time in direct sun during hot weather.
3	What concern about the plan does the writer consider? Explain how the writer responds to that concern.	The writer considers that shelters may cost too much or block sidewalks. The response is to start with a small pilot at busy stops with enough sidewalk space and review the results.
4	Who is the intended audience? Why does the writer include references to heat-safety guidance and ridership maps?	The intended audience is Riverton City Council members. The references let readers check the evidence and understand why the plan targets busy stops.

PART 3 • YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

To the school principal: Our school should add a water-bottle filling station near the gym. During practices, athletes need easy access to drinking water, and the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention explains that drinking water supports healthy hydration. A survey of team captains could show how often students currently leave practice to find a fountain. Although a new station costs money, the school could compare prices and begin with one location. Sources consulted: CDC drinking-water guidance and student survey results.

Accept equivalent wording when students identify the claim, evidence, alternative concern, response, audience, and purpose of references accurately. For the open response, accept varied topics if the proposal includes all required argument elements and stays within the stated word range.