

Evidence in the Talk

Listen for observations, test conditions, and respectful responses.

5.3.C "listen actively to others' explanations to identify relevant evidence and engage respectfully in scientific discussion."

NAME _____

DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK _____ Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline two details that speakers use as evidence. Circle one respectful discussion move, such as listening without interrupting, asking a question, or replying carefully.

Soil Scientists Talk It Through

- ① At the school garden, Maya and Luis studied two cups of soil. Both held the same kind of soil and received the same amount of water. Cup A had dried leaves mixed in, while Cup B did not. After three weeks, Maya noticed that Cup A contained fewer whole leaf pieces and looked darker. She shared these observations with the group.
- ② Luis said, "I think tiny living things in the soil helped break down the leaves in Cup A." He pointed to Maya's report that fewer whole leaf pieces remained. Ana listened without interrupting. Then she said, "The darker soil also supports your idea, because broken-down plant material can become part of soil. Did both cups get equal water?" Maya answered yes.
- ③ Jamal offered a different explanation. "Maybe the leaves simply fell apart because they were wet," he said. Ana replied, "That could be possible. However, both cups got the same water, and only Cup A had leaves mixed into its soil." The group decided that Luis's explanation fit the observations better, but they wanted to repeat the investigation before making a final claim.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE _____ Use the passage

1 What explanation did Luis give? What observation did he use as evidence?

2 What question did Ana ask to check whether the comparison was fair? Why was that question relevant?

3 Jamal gave a different explanation. Which two test details did Ana use when she replied respectfully?

4 What did the group decide about Luis's explanation, and what did they want to do before making a final claim?

3 YOUR TURN _____ Your own words

A classmate says, "The ice cube in sunlight melted faster because sunlight warmed it." After ten minutes, the ice cube in sunlight is smaller than an ice cube in shade. Write three sentences: restate the classmate's explanation, name the observation that supports it, and ask one respectful question about whether the test was fair.

PART 1 • READ AND MARK

Underline two details that speakers use as evidence. Circle one respectful discussion move, such as listening without interrupting, asking a question, or replying carefully. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 • ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What explanation did Luis give? What observation did he use as evidence?	Luis said tiny living things in the soil helped break down the leaves. He used the observation that fewer whole leaf pieces remained in Cup A.
2	What question did Ana ask to check whether the comparison was fair? Why was that question relevant?	Ana asked whether both cups got equal water. Equal water helps show that water was not the reason for the difference between the cups.
3	Jamal gave a different explanation. Which two test details did Ana use when she replied respectfully?	Ana said both cups got the same water and only Cup A had leaves mixed into its soil.
4	What did the group decide about Luis's explanation, and what did they want to do before making a final claim?	The group thought Luis's explanation fit the observations better. They wanted to repeat the investigation before making a final claim.

PART 3 • YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

You think sunlight warmed the ice cube and made it melt faster. The ice cube in sunlight had less solid ice after ten minutes, which supports your explanation. Did the class begin with ice cubes that were the same size?

Accept equivalent restatements of the explanation, relevant observations, and respectful questions about fair-test conditions. The question may ask about equal ice-cube size, the same starting time, or other controlled conditions.