

Water, Claims, Evidence

Use evidence and reasoning to evaluate a historical claim.

6.19.E “formulate and communicate visually, orally, or in writing a claim supported by evidence and reasoning related to a social studies topic; and”

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK _____ Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline the main claim in the passage. Circle two evidence details, then draw an arrow from each detail to a sentence that explains how it supports the claim.

Fresh Water for a Growing City

- ① In 1842, New York City opened the Croton Aqueduct, a system that carried fresh water from the Croton River to the city. Before then, many residents got water from wells, pumps, or vendors. These sources could be dirty or limited during fires. The aqueduct used gravity to move water through a covered channel and pipes. City leaders hoped the new supply would make daily life safer and provide enough water for a fast-growing population of residents.
- ② Historians can make the claim that the Croton Aqueduct improved public safety in New York City. One piece of evidence is that it supplied water for fighting fires. In 1845, a major fire in lower Manhattan burned for hours, but firefighters used water from the new system as they worked. Another piece of evidence is that people had a steadier source of water than scattered wells and pumps. A reliable supply could reduce the need to use unsafe sources.
- ③ However, an effective claim should recognize limits in the evidence. The aqueduct did not solve every health problem. In the 1800s, germs were not yet understood by most people, and water could still become contaminated after it reached city pipes. Also, not every neighborhood received the same service at once. A careful conclusion is that the Croton Aqueduct made New York City safer in important ways, especially by increasing water for fires and daily use, but it was not a complete solution.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE _____ Use the passage

1 What claim does the passage make about the Croton Aqueduct?

2 Choose one detail from the passage that is evidence for the claim. Explain how the detail supports the claim.

3 What reasoning connects a reliable water supply to public safety?

4 Name one limit that should be included when making a claim about the aqueduct. Why does this limit make the claim more accurate?

3 YOUR TURN _____ Your own words

Write a four-sentence claim that answers this question: Was building the Croton Aqueduct a wise decision for New York City? State your claim, use two details from the passage as evidence, explain how each detail supports your claim, and include one limit.

PART 1 • READ AND MARK

Underline the main claim in the passage. Circle two evidence details, then draw an arrow from each detail to a sentence that explains how it supports the claim. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 • ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What claim does the passage make about the Croton Aqueduct?	The Croton Aqueduct improved public safety in New York City.
2	Choose one detail from the passage that is evidence for the claim. Explain how the detail supports the claim.	Answers may identify water for fighting fires, including firefighters using the system during the 1845 fire, or a steadier water source than wells and pumps. The explanation should connect the detail to greater safety.
3	What reasoning connects a reliable water supply to public safety?	A reliable supply could reduce people's need to use unsafe water sources, making daily life safer.
4	Name one limit that should be included when making a claim about the aqueduct. Why does this limit make the claim more accurate?	Answers may note that water could still be contaminated or that neighborhoods did not receive equal service at once. The limit shows that the aqueduct did not solve every health or water problem.

PART 3 • YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

Building the Croton Aqueduct was a wise decision because it improved safety for a growing city. Firefighters used water from the new system during the 1845 lower Manhattan fire, so the aqueduct gave them a stronger resource for protecting people and buildings. It also gave residents a steadier supply than scattered wells and pumps, which could reduce the use of unsafe water sources. However, the system did not stop all contamination or serve every neighborhood at once.

Accept claims that take a clear position and use two accurate passage details with reasoning that connects each detail to the position. The response must also include an accurate limit, even if the student still concludes that the decision was wise.