Shade Under Review

Trace how evidence and limits shape an environmental recommendation.

10.RI.1 "Key Ideas and Confirming Details Explain how authors organize an analysis or series of ideas or events, including the order in which points are made, how they are introduced and developed, and the connections that are drawn among them..."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline the report's main claim and its final recommendation. Circle evidence or limits that support or qualify those ideas, then number the report's three stages in order.

Should Cities Plant More Street Trees?

1 On a July afternoon, pavement can make a neighborhood feel hotter than the regional forecast. A planning report considers planting street trees as one response. Its first point is straightforward: shade blocks sunlight before it warms sidewalks and building walls. Studies in many cities have found lower land-surface temperatures in areas with more tree canopy, although differences vary by location and time of day. This evidence supports a limited claim, not a promise that every shaded block will feel equally cool. To plan wisely, officials must ask where shade falls, who uses the space, and how long young trees need care.

2 Next, planners compare measurements rather than relying on a single impression. In a planning example, a table lists average afternoon surface temperatures for three sites: an unshaded parking lot, 126°F; a sidewalk beside young trees, 111°F; and a park path under mature canopy, 89°F. The table makes the comparison visible, but it does not prove that tree age alone caused every difference. Pavement type, nearby buildings, and moisture can also affect surface temperature. Still, the pattern gives planners relevant evidence for prioritizing shade in places where people walk or wait. The report introduces data after explaining the shade idea, then uses limits on the data to avoid an overly broad conclusion.

3 Finally, the report considers a competing concern: trees cost money to plant and maintain. It notes that a sapling needs watering, pruning, and protection, especially during its first years. The report then connects that concern to its recommendation, proposing that cities fund maintenance along with planting. Its conclusion is careful: expanding canopy can reduce exposure to hot surfaces, so shaded routes deserve priority where heat and pedestrian use overlap. A weaker argument would say trees eliminate urban heat or would cite only the 89°F reading while ignoring the other sites. By acknowledging costs, comparing sites, and narrowing its claim, the report builds a more valid argument.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. How does the report organize its argument from the first paragraph to the final paragraph?

2. What pattern do the table's temperatures show? Use at least two values from the passage in your answer.

3. Why would the claim that trees eliminate urban heat be unsupported by the report?

4. How does the report connect the concern about maintenance to its final recommendation?

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Write a three-sentence evaluation of the report's argument. Use two pieces of evidence from the passage, and name one additional piece of information that would make the argument stronger.

ANSWER KEY

Shade Under Review

GRADE 10 · 10.RI.1

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline the report's main claim and its final recommendation. Circle evidence or limits that support or qualify those ideas, then number the report's three stages in order. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	How does the report organize its argument from the first paragraph to the final paragraph?	**It introduces the idea that shade can reduce surface heating, develops it with comparative temperature data and limits, then addresses maintenance costs before giving a careful recommendation.**
2	What pattern do the table's temperatures show? Use at least two values from the passage in your answer.	**The sites with more tree shade have lower average surface temperatures: the unshaded parking lot is 126°F, the sidewalk by young trees is 111°F, and the path under mature canopy is 89°F.**
3	Why would the claim that trees eliminate urban heat be unsupported by the report?	**The report only says canopy can reduce exposure to hot surfaces. It also explains that pavement type, buildings, moisture, location, and time of day can affect temperature.**
4	How does the report connect the concern about maintenance to its final recommendation?	**It explains that young trees need care, then recommends that cities fund maintenance along with planting so the proposed tree program can work.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

The report's claim that shaded routes should be prioritized is mostly valid because its table compares 126°F, 111°F, and 89°F surfaces. It also admits that pavement, buildings, and moisture may influence the results, which prevents the data from proving too much. The argument would be stronger with air-temperature readings or results from more than one city.

Accept responses that accurately trace the report's sequence, interpret the temperature comparison, and distinguish a supported limited claim from an exaggerated claim. For Part 3, accept reasonable additional evidence if the student uses two accurate details from the passage and evaluates the reasoning.