

Revision Detective

Notice what works, then make information clearer and stronger.

10.W.3.B “Use peer- and self-evaluation to edit writing for clarity and quality of information, addressing strengths and making suggestions regarding how writing might be improved.”

NAME _____

DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK _____ Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline one stated strength in the writing or review. Number three specific improvement suggestions or revision actions, then label the strength S and each improvement I.

A Proposal Gets Stronger

- ① Leila drafted a short article proposing that the school add a native-plant garden near the bus loop. Her first version opened with, “Plants would make the area better.” During self-review, she noticed that better did not explain a benefit. She replaced it with a claim that native plants can provide habitat for pollinators and reduce runoff when rain soaks into the soil. She also checked whether each detail supported her purpose. A sentence about her favorite flower did not explain the proposal, so she removed it. Her revision gave readers a clearer reason to consider the garden.
- ② Then Leila asked Omar to read the article as a peer reviewer. Omar began with a strength: the revised opening stated a focused claim and named two useful outcomes. He next wrote, “Add a source for the runoff information, so readers can judge where the fact came from.” He also pointed to the phrase “lots of insects” and suggested a more precise description, such as “bees, butterflies, and other pollinators.” Omar did not rewrite the article for Leila. Instead, his notes identified what worked, named a place that needed attention, and explained how a change could improve the information.
- ③ Leila used the feedback, but she made her own decisions. She added a citation to a local watershed agency report and changed “lots of insects” to “pollinators, including bees and butterflies.” Before submitting the article, she read it once more. She found that the final paragraph repeated the idea that the garden would be attractive. Because that point had already appeared in the opening, she cut the repetition and used the space to explain who would water the plants during summer. Her final draft kept the strong claim, included support readers could verify, and answered a practical question that the earlier version had left unclear.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE _____ Use the passage

1 What weakness did Leila find in the word "better," and what information did she add to fix it?

2 State one strength Omar identified and one specific change he suggested.

3 Why did Omar ask Leila to add a source for the runoff information?

4 What did Leila remove from her final paragraph, and what practical information did she add instead?

3 YOUR TURN _____ Your own words

Write a 75-90 word proposal for one practical improvement at your school. Then write a self-evaluation with one specific strength and two revisions, and ask a peer to provide one strength and one suggestion.

PART 1 • READ AND MARK

Underline one stated strength in the writing or review. Number three specific improvement suggestions or revision actions, then label the strength S and each improvement I. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 • ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What weakness did Leila find in the word “better,” and what information did she add to fix it?	“Better” did not explain a benefit. She explained that native plants can provide pollinator habitat and reduce runoff when rain soaks into soil.
2	State one strength Omar identified and one specific change he suggested.	He said the opening had a focused claim and two useful outcomes. He suggested adding a source for the runoff information or replacing “lots of insects” with a more precise description.
3	Why did Omar ask Leila to add a source for the runoff information?	A source would let readers judge where the fact came from.
4	What did Leila remove from her final paragraph, and what practical information did she add instead?	She removed repeated information about the garden being attractive. She added an explanation of who would water the plants during summer.

PART 3 • YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

Proposal: Our school should place a water-bottle filling station outside the gym. Students leaving practice often wait at the existing fountain, and a second station would shorten the line before afternoon buses arrive. The station should include a counter that shows how many disposable bottles it has prevented. The principal could ask the facilities manager to compare installation costs with the cost of maintaining the current fountain. This information would help the school decide whether the project fits its budget. Self-evaluation: Strength: I identify a location and explain why students would use it. Revisions: I would add the number of students affected and a source for the installation-cost estimate. Peer evaluation: Strength: The proposal connects the station to a busy time and place. Suggestion: Explain whether the gym location has access to plumbing, because that detail affects feasibility.

Accept equivalent strengths, suggestions, and revision explanations that accurately match the passage. For the open task, accept proposals within the word range that include a specific self-evaluation and peer feedback focused on clarity or the quality of information.