Shade Under Review

Weigh evidence and counterclaims before making a recommendation.

11.R.1.D "Synthesize multiple streams of evidence to support claims and acknowledge counterclaims."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline the main claim and two details that support it. Circle one counterclaim or limitation, and number the different evidence streams you use to judge the claim.

Should Riverton Plant More Street Trees?

1 In 2024, Riverton's planning department mapped afternoon summer temperatures in 18 neighborhoods. Blocks with mature tree canopies covering at least 30 percent of the ground averaged 4 degrees Fahrenheit cooler than nearby blocks with little shade. The department also measured surface temperatures at bus stops. A shaded stop's pavement was often more than 20 degrees cooler than pavement in direct sun. These observations led planners to claim that expanding street-tree planting could make outdoor travel safer during heat waves, especially for people who walk, wait for buses, or work outside.

2 Other records support the claim from a different angle. After Riverton planted 600 trees near three elementary schools between 2019 and 2022, the schools' electricity use during June through August fell 8 percent, according to utility billing records, even though enrollment changed little. Nurses at those schools reported fewer heat-related visits during recess months, from 31 visits in 2019 to 18 in 2022. Neither record proves that trees alone caused the changes. The schools also replaced some windows and added water stations, so the evidence is strongest when considered alongside the temperature mapping.

3 Some residents oppose a large planting program. They note that young trees need watering, pruning, and several years of growth before they provide broad shade. The parks department estimates that planting and caring for one street tree costs about $1,200 over its first three years, and poorly chosen species can worsen pollen problems or damage sidewalks. Those concerns challenge a claim that trees are a quick, inexpensive solution. Still, the temperature maps show an immediate need in low-shade areas, while the school records suggest possible long-term benefits. A careful plan could prioritize drought-tolerant, low-allergen species and budget for maintenance.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. How do the neighborhood maps and bus-stop measurements work together to support planners' claim about outdoor safety?

2. Why does paragraph 2 present the school records as support rather than proof that trees caused the changes? What other evidence makes the argument stronger?

3. What counterclaim do opponents make about a large planting program? Use two details from the passage to support your answer.

4. Which parts of the careful plan respond to both the evidence for planting and the counterclaim against it? Explain the connection.

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Write a 70 to 90 word recommendation to Riverton's council about street-tree planting. Support a clear claim with evidence from at least two different streams in the passage, and acknowledge one counterclaim before explaining how the plan should address it.

ANSWER KEY

Shade Under Review

GRADE 11 · 11.R.1.D

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline the main claim and two details that support it. Circle one counterclaim or limitation, and number the different evidence streams you use to judge the claim. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	How do the neighborhood maps and bus-stop measurements work together to support planners' claim about outdoor safety?	**Both show that shade lowers heat exposure: tree-covered blocks were cooler, and shaded bus-stop pavement was much cooler than pavement in direct sun.**
2	Why does paragraph 2 present the school records as support rather than proof that trees caused the changes? What other evidence makes the argument stronger?	**The schools also replaced windows and added water stations, so trees may not be the only cause. The temperature mapping strengthens the argument by independently showing that tree canopy is linked to cooler conditions.**
3	What counterclaim do opponents make about a large planting program? Use two details from the passage to support your answer.	**Opponents argue that trees are not a quick, inexpensive solution because young trees need years of care before giving broad shade and each tree costs about $1,200 during its first three years. Pollen and sidewalk damage are additional concerns.**
4	Which parts of the careful plan respond to both the evidence for planting and the counterclaim against it? Explain the connection.	**Prioritizing low-shade areas responds to the heat evidence. Choosing drought-tolerant, low-allergen species and budgeting for maintenance respond to concerns about water, pollen, cost, and care.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

Riverton should begin planting trees in low-shade neighborhoods, but it should do so through a funded, careful program. Temperature mapping shows that canopy-rich blocks and shaded bus stops are cooler, which supports an urgent need for shade. School utility and nurse records also suggest that trees may reduce summer energy use and heat-related problems over time. Critics are right that young trees cost money and need care. The city should select low-allergen, drought-tolerant species and include maintenance costs in its budget.

Accept claims that accurately combine at least two distinct evidence streams, such as temperature measurements and school records. Students should acknowledge a passage-based counterclaim and explain a realistic response rather than simply dismissing it.