

Smoke Plan Showdown

Compare a health brief with a facilities memo.

11.RI.3 "Integration of Concepts Analyze information within and between paired passages for similar and conflicting ideas and how authors reach similar or different conclusions. Compare and contrast informational and technical texts for intent..."

NAME _____

DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK _____ Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline each author's main conclusion, circle evidence or technical details that support it, and number one point where the texts agree and one point where they differ.

Two Plans for Smoke Days

- ① Text A, a county health department brief, addresses days when wildfire smoke raises the Air Quality Index, or AQI. It explains that fine particles, called PM_{2.5}, can reach deep into the lungs and may worsen asthma or heart and lung conditions. The brief advises schools to use the AQI forecast before outdoor practices and to move strenuous activities indoors when air quality reaches the "Unhealthy" range. Its central conclusion is precautionary: reducing students' exposure during smoke events is the safest immediate response for schools when practical.
- ② The brief supports this conclusion with monitoring data and a risk-based explanation. AQI readings translate measured particle concentrations into public health categories, so staff can use one familiar scale rather than guess from the sky's appearance. The writers stress that smoke can shift quickly with wind, and they note that children with asthma may be affected at lower exposure levels. However, the brief gives limited detail about building systems. It tells schools to close windows and use filtered indoor air, but it does not specify which filters or how to inspect equipment.
- ③ Text B, a facilities engineer's memo, agrees that schools should reduce smoke entering classrooms, but reaches a narrower conclusion about outdoor activities. It recommends checking each building's HVAC system before smoke season, using filters rated MERV 13 or the highest rating the system can handle, and replacing filters when pressure readings show they are loaded. Instead of automatically moving every practice indoors at the Unhealthy AQI level, the memo proposes adjusting activity by student symptoms, available indoor space, and local AQI forecasts. Its purpose is operational: it gives maintenance staff steps, specifications, and limits. That detail makes its directions clearer for technicians, though less accessible to families.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE _____ Use the passage

1 What concern do both texts share? Identify one different type of support each text uses for that concern.

2 How do the authors differ in their conclusions about outdoor practices when the AQI is Unhealthy?

3 Compare the authors' purposes. How does each author's purpose shape the information included?

4 Which text is clearer for a family deciding whether an outdoor practice should change? Use two features of the texts to explain your answer.

3 YOUR TURN _____ Your own words

Write exactly three sentences recommending a smoke-day plan for a school. Include one point where the texts agree, one difference between their conclusions, and a final decision that explains which text you would follow more closely for outdoor activities.

PART 1 • READ AND MARK

Underline each author's main conclusion, circle evidence or technical details that support it, and number one point where the texts agree and one point where they differ. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 • ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What concern do both texts share? Identify one different type of support each text uses for that concern.	Both texts seek to reduce students' exposure to wildfire smoke. Text A uses AQI and health-risk information, while Text B uses HVAC, filter, and pressure-reading details.
2	How do the authors differ in their conclusions about outdoor practices when the AQI is Unhealthy?	Text A advises moving strenuous activities indoors at the Unhealthy level. Text B does not support an automatic move indoors and recommends considering symptoms, indoor space, and forecasts.
3	Compare the authors' purposes. How does each author's purpose shape the information included?	Text A aims to guide health-protective school decisions, so it explains AQI and health risks. Text B aims to direct facilities operations, so it includes equipment steps, filter ratings, and system limits.
4	Which text is clearer for a family deciding whether an outdoor practice should change? Use two features of the texts to explain your answer.	Text A is clearer for families because it explains AQI in a familiar public-health scale and gives a direct activity recommendation. Text B uses technical terms and maintenance specifications meant for technicians.

PART 3 • YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

Both texts call for reducing smoke that enters classrooms. Text A calls for moving strenuous activities indoors at the Unhealthy level, while Text B favors decisions based on symptoms, space, and forecasts. I would follow Text A more closely for activity decisions because its precautionary approach protects students when smoke changes quickly.

Accept equivalent descriptions of the shared goal, differing conclusions, and audience-based clarity. For the open response, require exactly three sentences that accurately integrate an agreement, a difference, and a supported recommendation.