Shade Claim Check

Evaluate evidence, limitations, and a public recommendation.

11.RI "The student will use textual evidence to demonstrate comprehension and build knowledge from grade-level complex informational texts read..."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline the report's main claim, circle each numerical data point, and number two limitations of the study. These marks will help you judge whether the recommendation is fully supported.

Do Bus Stop Roofs Reduce Heat?

(1) In July 2023, a team at Riverton Transit tested whether shade structures could lower temperatures at bus stops. The team placed temperature sensors at 12 stops with new perforated-metal roofs and 12 nearby stops without roofs. At 3 p.m. for 20 clear days, shaded benches averaged 6.8 degrees Fahrenheit cooler than unshaded benches. Riders at shaded stops also reported waiting more comfortably in a voluntary survey. The report argues that the city should install roofs at every high-ridership stop. Its main claim rests on measured temperature differences, while the survey adds riders' opinions about comfort.

(2) However, the test does not prove that roofs alone caused every difference. The shaded stops may have differed in pavement, nearby buildings, tree cover, or wind. In addition, 20 clear summer days cannot show how roofs perform during rain, winter, or a heat wave. The report acknowledges that the survey was voluntary, so its respondents may not represent all riders. To check the temperature finding, a reader could compare it with sensor records from a second city or repeat the test by randomly assigning similar stops to receive roofs. Such evidence would strengthen the conclusion if it produced a similar cooling pattern.

(3) The memo uses a problem-solution structure. It begins with the test design and numerical results, then identifies limits and proposes ways to verify them. This order makes the recommendation sound evidence-based rather than purely promotional. Still, the evidence supports a cautious conclusion: roofs probably reduce afternoon bench temperatures under the tested conditions, but the city needs broader data before requiring them at every high-ridership stop. Cost, accessibility, maintenance, and conditions in other seasons also matter when deciding where to install them.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. What is the report's main claim? Identify the strongest measured evidence used to support it.

2. How relevant and reliable is the voluntary rider survey as evidence for the report's recommendation? Use one detail from the passage.

3. Why does the study not prove that roofs alone caused the cooler temperatures? Name two possible problems with the comparison.

4. How does the third paragraph's organization affect the memo's purpose? Explain how the paragraph changes the recommendation.

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Write a three-sentence recommendation to Riverton officials. Use two details from the passage, include one study limitation, and propose one next step for checking or expanding the program.

ANSWER KEY

Shade Claim Check

GRADE 11 · 11.RI

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline the report's main claim, circle each numerical data point, and number two limitations of the study. These marks will help you judge whether the recommendation is fully supported. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What is the report's main claim? Identify the strongest measured evidence used to support it.	**The report claims that the city should install roofs at every high-ridership stop. Its strongest evidence is that shaded benches averaged 6.8 degrees Fahrenheit cooler at 3 p.m. across 20 clear days.**
2	How relevant and reliable is the voluntary rider survey as evidence for the report's recommendation? Use one detail from the passage.	**The survey is relevant because it provides riders' views about comfort, but it is limited because voluntary respondents may not represent all riders.**
3	Why does the study not prove that roofs alone caused the cooler temperatures? Name two possible problems with the comparison.	**The stops may have differed in factors such as pavement, nearby buildings, tree cover, or wind. The study also examined only 20 clear summer days.**
4	How does the third paragraph's organization affect the memo's purpose? Explain how the paragraph changes the recommendation.	**It moves from results to limitations and verification, making the memo sound evidence-based rather than promotional. It changes the broad recommendation into a cautious call for more data before requiring roofs at every high-ridership stop.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

Riverton should begin by installing roofs at its busiest bus stops because shaded benches were 6.8 degrees Fahrenheit cooler during the test. The city should not yet install roofs at every high-ridership stop, since the study covered only 20 clear summer days and nearby conditions may have differed. Before expanding the program, officials should run a randomized comparison at similar stops and consider costs, maintenance, and seasonal weather.

Accept equivalent claims, evidence, limitations, and verification methods that are grounded in the passage. For the open task, require three sentences, two accurate passage details, a meaningful limitation, and a feasible next step.