

Evidence in Motion

Trace how a model analysis connects claims, counterclaims, and credible evidence.

11.W.1.B.iv "Write analyses that: Organize claims, counterclaims, and evidence in a sustained and logical sequence that explains how the credible evidence supports well-defined points of view."

NAME _____

DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK _____ Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline the writer's main claim and final position, circle each source or evidence detail, write C beside the counterclaim, and number the paragraphs 1 through 3 to show the sequence of reasoning.

Later Starts, Stronger Learning

- ① Our district should move high school's first bell to 8:30 a.m. or later. This change would not solve every challenge teenagers face, but it would better match school schedules to adolescent sleep patterns. The American Academy of Pediatrics recommends that middle and high schools start at 8:30 a.m. or later because biological shifts during puberty make it hard for many teens to fall asleep early. That recommendation supports the proposal because a schedule that routinely begins before students can obtain adequate sleep asks them to learn during a period when alertness is often reduced.
- ② In Seattle, researchers studied students before and after two public high schools delayed their start time by 55 minutes in 2016. Their 2018 study in *Science Advances* found that students' median sleep duration increased by 34 minutes, and course grades rose by 4.5 percent. Because the study compared the same schools across the schedule change, its results offer more than an opinion about tiredness. The findings support a later start because they connect additional sleep with outcomes schools value: students arrived better rested and performed somewhat better in class. Still, the study does not prove that sleep alone caused every grade increase.
- ③ Opponents reasonably note that a later dismissal could interfere with bus routes, sports, after-school jobs, and family schedules. That counterclaim deserves local evidence, not dismissal: the district should compare route capacity, activity schedules, and family survey results before choosing a time. Yet inconvenience alone is weaker than the health and learning evidence unless those records show that a workable schedule is impossible. The American Academy of Pediatrics recommendation and the Seattle study establish a clear reason to try a later start. A phased pilot, followed by attendance, sleep, and transportation data, would test whether the benefits outweigh the local costs.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE _____ Use the passage

1 State the writer’s central claim. What limit does the writer place on that claim in paragraph 1?

2 What evidence from the Seattle study does the writer use, and how does the writer explain its connection to the claim?

3 What counterclaim does paragraph 3 present? What local evidence does the writer say should be examined before a decision?

4 How does the order of the three paragraphs build the writer’s final recommendation?

3 YOUR TURN _____ Your own words

Write a 120- to 160-word analysis arguing for or against a school policy about student phones during class. State a clear claim, use and explain two credible sources, address one counterclaim, and end with a conclusion that follows from your evidence.

PART 1 • READ AND MARK

Underline the writer's main claim and final position, circle each source or evidence detail, write C beside the counterclaim, and number the paragraphs 1 through 3 to show the sequence of reasoning. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 • ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	State the writer's central claim. What limit does the writer place on that claim in paragraph 1?	The district should begin high school at 8:30 a.m. or later. The writer says this change would not solve every challenge teenagers face.
2	What evidence from the Seattle study does the writer use, and how does the writer explain its connection to the claim?	The study found that median sleep increased by 34 minutes and grades rose by 4.5 percent after the 55-minute delay. The writer explains that these results connect additional sleep with better-rested students and somewhat stronger classroom performance.
3	What counterclaim does paragraph 3 present? What local evidence does the writer say should be examined before a decision?	A later dismissal could disrupt buses, sports, jobs, and family schedules. The writer says the district should examine route capacity, activity schedules, and family survey results.
4	How does the order of the three paragraphs build the writer's final recommendation?	The writer first states a claim supported by medical guidance, then adds study results, and finally addresses practical objections before recommending a phased pilot to weigh benefits against local costs.

PART 3 • YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

Our school should require students to store phones during class, while allowing access before school, after school, and in emergencies. UNESCO's 2023 Global Education Monitoring Report states that excessive smartphone use is associated with lower educational performance, which supports limiting a frequent classroom distraction. In addition, OECD's PISA 2022 results found that students who reported distraction by digital devices in mathematics lessons tended to score lower in mathematics. This correlation does not prove that phones alone lower scores, but it adds credible evidence that attention deserves protection. Critics may say families need immediate contact. The policy can address that concern through the main office and emergency procedures, while keeping routine messages from interrupting instruction. Therefore, supervised phone storage is a balanced policy.

Accept equivalent statements that accurately identify the claim, evidence, counterclaim, and reasoning sequence. For the open response, require a sustained logical sequence in which each credible source is connected explicitly to the writer's position and the counterclaim receives a reasoned response.