Sharper Draft Decisions

Analyze how evidence, precision, and conventions strengthen a proposal.

11.W.3 "Usage and Mechanics Revise writing for clarity of content, accuracy, and depth of information. Use peer- and self-evaluation to edit writing for clarity and quality of information…"

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline claims supported by a number, date, or named source. Circle vague words or phrases, then number each sentence that needs a convention correction or more detail before a principal could act on the proposal.

Draft Proposal: Cafeteria Food-Waste Audit

1. Our school should begin a cafeteria food-waste audit this fall. During a five-day lunch observation in March, the Green Team weighed 184 pounds of unopened packaged food and untouched whole fruit left on trays. The total did not include partly eaten food, so it describes only one portion of daily waste. The U.S. Environmental Protection Agency reports that food was the largest category of material sent to U.S. landfills in 2018. Tracking what students discard could help the cafeteria order more carefully and donate safe, unopened items when local rules allow.

2. The audit would be easy and cheap. A staff member can weigh unopened items after each lunch and write the total on a shared spreadsheet. Students could also explain why they skipped certain foods, because the menu is sometimes bad. The project will save a lot of money quickly, and it should start soon. We should buy some bins, gloves, and a scale. The principal and cafeteria manager can figure out the details later. At the end of each month, the team would compare the weights with the March observation and report the results to the school.

3. Beginning October 1, the team could run a four-week trial. Ms. Ortiz, the cafeteria manager, would record the weight of unopened items after each lunch, while two student volunteers would enter the data. The team would share a one-page report with the principal on November 8. The audit matters, students will notice. If the records show repeated waste of a particular item, the cafeteria could ask students for specific feedback before changing an order. This process might make lunchtime better for everyone and show that the school cares about responsible use of resources.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. What two pieces of evidence in paragraph 1 strengthen the case for the audit?

2. Which words make the financial claim in paragraph 2 unclear, and what measurable information should replace them?

3. What detail is missing from the sentence about buying bins, gloves, and a scale that a decision maker would need?

4. Copy and correct the comma splice in paragraph 3.

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Write a 100 to 130 word peer-review note for a classmate's proposal about a school improvement. Name one strength, suggest two specific revisions for clarity, accuracy, or depth and explain why they matter, then identify one convention or style correction in a professional tone.

ANSWER KEY

Sharper Draft Decisions

GRADE 11 · 11.W.3

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline claims supported by a number, date, or named source. Circle vague words or phrases, then number each sentence that needs a convention correction or more detail before a principal could act on the proposal. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What two pieces of evidence in paragraph 1 strengthen the case for the audit?	**The Green Team measured 184 pounds of unopened food and whole fruit during a five-day observation, and the writer cites the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency's 2018 landfill information.**
2	Which words make the financial claim in paragraph 2 unclear, and what measurable information should replace them?	**"A lot of money quickly" is unclear. The writer should provide a projected dollar amount of savings and a time frame.**
3	What detail is missing from the sentence about buying bins, gloves, and a scale that a decision maker would need?	**The proposal needs specifics such as the number of items needed and their estimated total cost.**
4	Copy and correct the comma splice in paragraph 3.	**The audit matters; students will notice. Accept two separate sentences or another correct revision.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

Your proposal opens with a clear goal and uses the student survey results well. To deepen the budget section, add the cost of each recycling bin, the number needed, and the total expense, so the principal can compare the request with available funds. Also identify who will empty the bins and how often, because a plan needs responsibilities as well as supplies. Replace "everyone hates the trash" with the survey percentage and a neutral phrase, which will make the claim accurate and professional. In the conclusion, change "the bins will work, they are important" to two sentences or join the ideas with a semicolon.

Accept equivalent evidence selections and reasonable revisions that add measurable, decision-relevant information. For the peer-review note, accept varied school-improvement topics if the response meets the word count and includes all required feedback elements.