

Speak, Then Assess

Examine how a speaker builds and judges an evidence-based proposal.

12.C.2.A.vi "Report orally on a topic or text or present an opinion. This includes: Evaluating the content and effectiveness of one's presentations, including the introduction, organization, strengths/weaknesses and evidence and reasoning..."

NAME _____

DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK _____ Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline Maya's claim and her final request, circle each piece of evidence, and number the presentation stages in order: introduction, evidence, solution, conclusion.

A Proposal for Shade

- ① At a town council meeting, Maya delivered a three-minute proposal urging the city to add shade trees near bus stops. She opened with a question: "How long would you wait on bare pavement when the temperature reaches 95 degrees?" The question gave listeners a familiar situation and stated her focus quickly. Maya then explained that pavement absorbs and releases heat, making uncovered stops uncomfortable and potentially dangerous during heat waves. Her introduction was direct, but she spoke rapidly through the last sentence, so some audience members may not have caught the connection between pavement and heat exposure.
- ② To support her claim, Maya cited a National Weather Service explanation that shade can lower surface temperatures, and she described observing riders move away from an unshaded stop outside the library. Next, she proposed a pilot program at five stops, followed by a review of rider feedback and maintenance costs. This sequence moved from problem to evidence to solution, so listeners could follow her reasoning. However, the observation outside the library was only one example. She did not provide local temperature measurements, a cost estimate, or evidence that trees could be planted at each selected stop. Adding those details would make her case more convincing.
- ③ Maya ended by asking the council to fund the pilot before next summer and by repeating her main point: shade at bus stops is a public-health need. The ending returned to her claim and gave the audience a specific action, which made it stronger than a vague summary. In self-evaluation, Maya noted that she maintained eye contact and used a slide of proposed locations. She also recognized a weakness: her slide listed a source, but she did not explain why that source was reliable. For a revision, she will slow her pace, explain the source's expertise, and add local data and projected costs before repeating her request.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE _____ Use the passage

1 Evaluate Maya's introduction. What makes it effective, and what delivery choice weakens it?

2 How does Maya organize the middle of her presentation, and why is that order effective for her audience?

3 Identify one strength and one weakness in Maya's evidence and reasoning.

4 Why is Maya's conclusion more effective than a vague summary? Name one revision she plans that would strengthen the presentation.

3 YOUR TURN _____ Your own words

Create a speaking outline for a 90-second oral opinion about a school policy. Include a hook, a clear claim, two pieces of evidence with reasoning, and a conclusion that asks for a specific action, then write exactly four sentences evaluating your introduction, organization, evidence and reasoning, and conclusion.

PART 1 • READ AND MARK

Underline Maya's claim and her final request, circle each piece of evidence, and number the presentation stages in order: introduction, evidence, solution, conclusion. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 • ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	Evaluate Maya's introduction. What makes it effective, and what delivery choice weakens it?	The opening question connects the issue to listeners and states the focus quickly. Speaking too rapidly may keep listeners from understanding the link between pavement and heat exposure.
2	How does Maya organize the middle of her presentation, and why is that order effective for her audience?	She moves from the problem to evidence to a proposed solution. This order helps listeners follow how her evidence supports her recommendation.
3	Identify one strength and one weakness in Maya's evidence and reasoning.	A strength is her use of a National Weather Service explanation about shade and surface temperatures. A weakness is that she lacks local measurements, cost estimates, and proof that trees can be planted at all five stops.
4	Why is Maya's conclusion more effective than a vague summary? Name one revision she plans that would strengthen the presentation.	It restates her claim and asks the council to take a specific action. She plans to explain the source's expertise, add local data and projected costs, and slow her pace.

PART 3 • YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

Speaking outline: Hook: How alert can students be when many of them begin class before their bodies are ready to learn? Claim: High schools should begin no earlier than 8:30 a.m. Evidence and reasoning 1: The American Academy of Pediatrics recommends that middle and high schools start at 8:30 a.m. or later to support adolescent sleep. Following this recommendation would better match school schedules to teenagers' sleep needs. Evidence and reasoning 2: The Centers for Disease Control and Prevention links insufficient sleep for high school students with poor academic performance and health risks. A later start would give more students a realistic chance to get adequate sleep. Conclusion and action: The school board should study bus routes and develop a plan for an 8:30 a.m. start next year. My opening question gives the audience a personal reason to consider the issue. My outline moves from the problem to expert evidence and then to a practical action. The two sources are credible, and each piece of evidence explains why a later start could help students. My conclusion repeats the claim and gives the school board a specific next step.

Accept equivalent evaluations that accurately cite the passage's details about Maya's introduction, organization, evidence, reasoning, conclusion, or revision plan. For the open task, accept varied policies if the outline includes all required parts and the evaluation contains exactly four sentences addressing the named elements.