

Light the Case

Trace how a facilities brief builds and tests a recommendation.

12.RI “The student will use textual evidence to demonstrate comprehension and build knowledge from grade-level complex informational texts read...”

NAME _____

DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK _____ Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline the writer’s recommendation, then number the three stages of the argument: problem, evidence, and action. Circle one phrase that reveals the writer’s attitude toward the current lighting system.

Facilities Brief: West Lot Lighting

- ① At North River High, the west parking lot uses 28 metal-halide fixtures installed in 2008. A facilities log records 19 lamp or ballast repairs during the past school year, including six repairs that required a rented lift. The lights operate from 5:30 a.m. until 10:00 p.m. on school days, and security staff have reported uneven visibility near the student entrance after rain. The district’s energy dashboard estimates that this lot used 31,400 kilowatt-hours last year. These records show a recurring operating issue, not a single unusual outage.
- ② Facilities recommends installing 28 LED fixtures during the July maintenance window. In a 2025 pilot, the district replaced twelve comparable fixtures at East River Middle School. Electric use for that lot fell 54 percent over the following eight months, measured against the same months the year before. The pilot also required one service call, compared with seven calls in the previous eight-month period. LEDs would not make the lot perfectly safe, but steadier lighting could reduce the shadows that force staff to investigate every dark corner. Delaying replacement keeps feeding money into an aging system.
- ③ Some committee members have asked whether the pilot’s results apply to a larger lot and whether installation might interrupt summer programs. Those questions deserve a vendor estimate and a work schedule before a contract is signed. Still, the committee should approve the change now because any LED project that cuts electricity use by 54 percent pays for itself within two years. The recommended sequence is to request bids in March, select a vendor in April, and complete work in July. This schedule puts a practical decision ahead of another year of repairs.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE _____ Use the passage

1 How does the order of the brief's ideas, from facility records to pilot results to a work schedule, advance the recommendation?

2 Evaluate the claim that any LED project cutting electricity use by 54 percent will pay for itself within two years. What makes this reasoning unsupported, and what information is needed?

3 What attitude does the phrase "feeding money into an aging system" create? Explain how that wording affects the brief's message.

4 Is the East River Middle School pilot relevant evidence for the proposed replacement? Explain both its strength and its limitation.

3 YOUR TURN _____ Your own words

Using a school or workplace problem, write a 70 to 90 word recommendation. Organize it from problem to evidence to action, use one deliberate phrase to convey attitude, and identify one fact a decision maker still needs before acting.

PART 1 • READ AND MARK

Underline the writer's recommendation, then number the three stages of the argument: problem, evidence, and action. Circle one phrase that reveals the writer's attitude toward the current lighting system. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 • ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	How does the order of the brief's ideas, from facility records to pilot results to a work schedule, advance the recommendation?	It first establishes that the current system has repeated problems, then offers results from a comparable pilot, and finally presents steps for carrying out the replacement. The sequence makes the recommendation appear evidence-based and ready to implement.
2	Evaluate the claim that any LED project cutting electricity use by 54 percent will pay for itself within two years. What makes this reasoning unsupported, and what information is needed?	A reduction in electricity use alone cannot prove a two-year payback for every project. The committee needs purchase and installation costs, utility rates, and projected savings or maintenance costs.
3	What attitude does the phrase "feeding money into an aging system" create? Explain how that wording affects the brief's message.	The phrase presents the current system as wasteful and draining resources. It makes delaying replacement seem irresponsible or costly.
4	Is the East River Middle School pilot relevant evidence for the proposed replacement? Explain both its strength and its limitation.	It is relevant because it involves comparable fixtures and provides before-and-after data on electricity use and service calls. It is limited because the brief does not establish that results from that lot will be the same for the larger high school lot.

PART 3 • YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

Our student newspaper should replace its paper sign-out sheet with a shared digital checkout form. During the last four publication days, editors spent 38 minutes locating borrowed cameras, and two cameras were returned after deadlines. A digital form would create a visible record instead of the current paper maze. Before buying software, however, the adviser should confirm the annual subscription price. The staff could test it for one issue before switching completely.

Accept equivalent explanations that cite the passage's structure, evidence, wording, or stated uncertainty. For the open response, check the word count, deliberate organization, evidence, attitude-setting language, and a specific missing fact.