

Review the Proposal

Evaluate a model proposal for clear, well-supported information.

12.W.3.B "Use peer- and self-evaluation to edit writing for clarity and quality of information, addressing strengths and making suggestions regarding how writing might be improved."

NAME _____

DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK _____ Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline one sentence that gives precise evidence, circle two claims that need clearer support or detail, and number your margin suggestions 1 and 2. These marks will help you evaluate clarity and quality of information.

A Proposal for Shade at Bus Stops

- ① Students who wait for the afternoon bus often stand in direct sun, especially during August and September. Our school has six bus-loading areas, but only two have permanent shade. Installing shade sails at the other four areas would make the wait safer and more comfortable. The sails would be made from UV-resistant fabric stretched between steel posts. They would not block buses or walking paths because the posts could be placed behind the curb. This change would help students, drivers, and staff who supervise dismissal.
- ② Shade sails are a practical option because they can cover a wide area without building a full roof. A preliminary quote from a local installer estimated \$4,800 for materials and installation at each location. For four locations, the project could cost about \$19,200 before permits or unexpected site work. The student council could ask the district facilities office to verify the estimate and identify funding sources. The proposal says the expense is reasonable, but it does not compare this cost with the current budget or explain which funds might be available. It also needs a source for the claim that shade will reduce heat-related risks.
- ③ To move forward, the school should form a small planning group of students, transportation staff, and facilities employees. The group could map each loading area, check underground utilities, and request bids from at least three contractors. After that, they should present their findings to the principal by November 15. This process would be quick and fair. It would also show whether the shade sails can be installed before next summer. If the project is approved, the group should publish a schedule so families know when a loading area may be temporarily closed.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE Use the passage

1 Identify one sentence that gives precise, useful information. Explain how it strengthens the proposal.

2 What information does paragraph 2 say is missing before readers can decide whether the expense is reasonable?

3 Which claim in the passage needs a source, and why would adding a source improve the writing?

4 The sentence "This process would be quick and fair" is vague. Name two concrete planning steps from paragraph 3 that a reviewer could use to improve it.

3 YOUR TURN Your own words

Copy a 4 to 6 sentence paragraph from a current draft, or write one about a school issue. Then write a peer-review note that cites one strength, gives two numbered suggestions identifying unclear or unsupported information and exact revisions, and includes one revised sentence.

PART 1 • READ AND MARK

Underline one sentence that gives precise evidence, circle two claims that need clearer support or detail, and number your margin suggestions 1 and 2. These marks will help you evaluate clarity and quality of information. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 • ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	Identify one sentence that gives precise, useful information. Explain how it strengthens the proposal.	The preliminary quote estimates \$4,800 for each location. It strengthens the proposal by giving a specific cost estimate.
2	What information does paragraph 2 say is missing before readers can decide whether the expense is reasonable?	The proposal needs a comparison with the current budget and an explanation of which funding sources might be available.
3	Which claim in the passage needs a source, and why would adding a source improve the writing?	The claim that shade will reduce heat-related risks needs a source. A source would make the claim more credible and supported.
4	The sentence "This process would be quick and fair" is vague. Name two concrete planning steps from paragraph 3 that a reviewer could use to improve it.	Possible steps include mapping each loading area, checking underground utilities, requesting bids from three contractors, and presenting findings by November 15.

PART 3 • YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

Sample draft: Our school should add a water-bottle filling station near the gym. Many students need it after practice. It would cost a lot, but it would help everyone. The project could happen soon. Strength: The phrase "near the gym" identifies a useful location. 1. "Many students need it after practice" is vague. Revise it to: "In a survey of 80 athletes, 57 said they refill bottles after practice." 2. "It would cost a lot" lacks evidence. Revise it to: "The vendor's May 3 estimate lists the station at \$3,200, and the student council will request a facilities grant to cover the cost." Revised sentence: "The vendor's May 3 estimate lists the station at \$3,200, and the student council will request a facilities grant to cover the cost."

Accept different well-supported sentences for strengths and different valid concerns about clarity or missing evidence. For the open task, accept relevant suggestions when each identifies a specific issue and offers a workable revision.