Behind the Claim

Examine why each source speaks and what its evidence can show.

8.C.4.C "Evaluate sources for their relationships, motives, intent, and content (e.g., social, emotional, commercial)."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline each source's main claim, circle words that show its connection to the park or its motive, and number the evidence each source gives. These marks will help you judge how much weight to give each source.

A Park Proposal

1 Riverton's city council is considering a small skate park beside the public library. Before the vote, eighth grader Lena compares three sources. First, she reads a flyer from RollRight, a company that sells ramps and safety gear. The flyer says a skate park will "transform Riverton into a youth-sports destination" and bring hundreds of visitors each weekend. It shows colorful drawings of crowded ramps, but it gives no study, dates, or names for its visitor estimate. RollRight has offered to bid on building the park.

2 Next, Lena watches a video posted by the Riverton Skate Club. Club members want a place to practice because the nearest skate park is six miles away. In the video, they describe learning balance, meeting friends, and asking adults to listen to young people. One speaker says that regular practice could help students feel less stressed. The video includes interviews with five club members, yet it does not include views from people who live beside the library. Its purpose is mainly social and emotional, although the club also wants the council's support.

3 Finally, Lena finds the city planning office's report. It lists the proposed site, estimated construction cost, noise rules, and results from a survey of 420 Riverton residents. The report states that 58 percent of surveyed residents support the park, while 24 percent oppose it and 18 percent are unsure. Because the planning office advises the council, its report aims to inform a public decision. Lena still checks the survey date and methods, since city staff may favor the proposal they were asked to study. She uses all three sources, but gives the report the most weight for numbers.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. What is RollRight's relationship to the proposed skate park, and how could that relationship affect its motive?

2. What important support is missing from RollRight's claim that hundreds of visitors will come each weekend? Why does that missing support matter?

3. What is the Skate Club video trying to do, and what detail shows that it gives only one side of the issue?

4. Why does Lena give the planning office report the most weight for numbers, and what possible bias does she still consider?

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Choose a school or community issue. In 3 or 4 sentences, evaluate two possible sources by explaining each source's relationship to the issue, likely motive or intent, and one content detail you would check before using it.

ANSWER KEY

Behind the Claim

GRADE 8 · 8.C.4.C

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline each source's main claim, circle words that show its connection to the park or its motive, and number the evidence each source gives. These marks will help you judge how much weight to give each source. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What is RollRight's relationship to the proposed skate park, and how could that relationship affect its motive?	**RollRight sells ramps and gear and wants to bid on building the park. It has a commercial reason to present the park as very beneficial.**
2	What important support is missing from RollRight's claim that hundreds of visitors will come each weekend? Why does that missing support matter?	**The flyer gives no study, dates, or named source for the estimate. Without support, readers cannot verify whether the visitor claim is reliable.**
3	What is the Skate Club video trying to do, and what detail shows that it gives only one side of the issue?	**The video aims to share club members' social and emotional reasons for wanting a park and gain council support. It interviews five club members but does not include people living beside the library.**
4	Why does Lena give the planning office report the most weight for numbers, and what possible bias does she still consider?	**The report includes a survey of 420 residents and specific results, costs, and rules. Lena considers that city staff may favor the proposal they were asked to study, so she checks the survey date and methods.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

Our school is considering later bus pickup times. A bus company's schedule proposal has a commercial motive because it may earn money from a new contract, so I would check its cost estimates and route data. A survey from students who ride buses aims to show riders' experiences, but I would check how many riders answered and whether the questions were balanced. I would use both sources while also looking for district transportation records before deciding which plan has the strongest support.

Accept equivalent explanations that connect a source's relationship to its likely purpose or bias and use specific passage evidence. For Part 3, accept any relevant issue and two sources if the student evaluates both sources rather than simply stating an opinion.