Garden Claim Check

Trace claims and judge the evidence behind them.

8.RI.1.C "Trace and evaluate the argument and specific claims in a text, assessing whether the reasoning and evidence are relevant and sufficient to support the claims."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline each claim Maya makes and number the claims. Circle each piece of evidence, then write the number of the claim it is meant to support beside it.

A Garden by the Bus Loop

1 At Monday's school board meeting, eighth grader Maya Ortiz proposed turning a strip of lawn beside the bus loop into a native-plant garden. She argued that the garden would make the campus a better place for learning. Her first reason was that students could observe insects, seeds, and soil during science classes instead of seeing them only in photographs. Maya noted that Lincoln Middle's science classes currently use a nearby park for one field observation each spring, but the park is a fifteen-minute walk away.

2 To support her proposal, Maya gave the board results from a poll of 126 students. In the poll, 94 students said they would like an outdoor area where classes could work. She also displayed photographs of a native garden at another school, showing monarch butterflies and several kinds of flowering plants. Finally, Maya said native plants usually need less watering after they become established, so the garden could help the school use water wisely. The board plans to vote after hearing public comments next month.

3 During questions, a board member asked how the project would affect the school budget. Maya replied that the garden could be built during a Saturday volunteer event. She pointed to a flyer from the city parks department offering free native-plant seedlings to community groups, and she reported that twelve families had signed up to help. Another board member asked whether students would continue using the garden after the first year. Maya answered that the science teacher had offered to bring two classes there in the fall.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. What is Maya's central claim about the native-plant garden?

2. Which claim is supported by both the city parks flyer and the family sign-up list?

3. Is the student poll relevant evidence for Maya's claim that the garden would improve learning? Explain your judgment.

4. Is Maya's evidence sufficient to show that the project would fit the school budget? Explain what additional evidence would help.

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Evaluate Maya's claim that native plants could help the school use water wisely. Write four sentences that use the stated evidence, explain whether it is relevant and sufficient, and name one additional piece of evidence that would strengthen the claim.

ANSWER KEY

Garden Claim Check

GRADE 8 · 8.RI.1.C

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline each claim Maya makes and number the claims. Circle each piece of evidence, then write the number of the claim it is meant to support beside it. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What is Maya's central claim about the native-plant garden?	**The garden would make the campus a better place for learning.**
2	Which claim is supported by both the city parks flyer and the family sign-up list?	**The claim that the garden could be built during a Saturday volunteer event.**
3	Is the student poll relevant evidence for Maya's claim that the garden would improve learning? Explain your judgment.	**It is somewhat relevant because it shows student interest in an outdoor class area, but it does not show that students would learn more in the garden.**
4	Is Maya's evidence sufficient to show that the project would fit the school budget? Explain what additional evidence would help.	**No. Free seedlings and volunteers may reduce costs, but the evidence does not show the total cost of materials or any other expenses. A budget estimate would help.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

Maya's water-use claim has one relevant piece of evidence: native plants usually need less watering after they are established. This information connects directly to the idea of using water wisely. Still, the evidence is not sufficient because it does not compare the proposed plants with the current lawn or show how much water each would need at this school. Records of the lawn's water use and an estimate for the garden would strengthen the claim.

Accept reasonable evaluations when students accurately distinguish relevance from sufficiency. For the open task, accept other logical additional evidence, such as local watering records, plant-care requirements, or a comparison of expected water use.