

Heat Claim Check

Evaluate evidence, claims, and source limits.

9.R.1.C "Analyze and evaluate the primary and secondary sources gathered for their credibility, reliability, accuracy, and usefulness that includes identifying their main and supporting ideas, points of view, conflicting information..."

NAME _____

DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK _____ Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline each source's main claim, circle details that show credibility or limits, and write 1 beside each conflict, bias, or misconception you find.

Three Sources, One Heat Question

- ① On a July afternoon, students in Riverton compared three sources about summer heat near their school. The first was a primary source: a city public-health department field log from a 2025 heat study. Trained staff recorded air temperatures at 20 bus stops, using the same shaded thermometer method. The log reported that stops without nearby tree shade averaged 6 degrees Fahrenheit warmer at 3 p.m. than shaded stops. Because it gives dates, locations, methods, and measurements, the log is useful evidence about those stops during that study. It does not prove that every unshaded place in the city has the same difference.
- ② The second source was a newspaper article that summarized the field log and interviewed a university climate researcher. It stated that planting trees would make every Riverton street six degrees cooler. This claim conflicts with the log's limited measurements: twenty bus stops at 3 p.m. on study days. The article is a secondary source, so it can help readers understand the study, but it provides no link to the full log or to evidence for its citywide prediction. Its main idea, that shade can reduce heat exposure, is supported more carefully than its exact citywide claim.
- ③ The third source was a flyer from GreenStreet Nurseries, a company that sells young trees. Its owner wrote, "One new tree can cool an entire neighborhood overnight." The flyer offers a homeowner's story but no measurements, dates, or research citation. Its viewpoint favors buying trees, and the owner's financial interest may create bias. The overnight neighborhood claim is a misconception because a single newly planted tree cannot immediately create broad shade. Still, the flyer could be useful for learning the company's prices and argument. When sources conflict, readers should favor precise, relevant evidence while noting each source's purpose and limits.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE _____ Use the passage

1 What is the newspaper article's main idea, and what passage detail limits its citywide claim?

2 Which source is the strongest evidence for the temperature difference at Riverton bus stops? Give two details that make it credible or reliable.

3 Explain one conflict between the field log and the newspaper article.

4 What shows that the nursery flyer may be biased and inaccurate? Name one limited purpose for which the flyer could still be useful.

3 YOUR TURN _____ Your own words

Write exactly three sentences recommending how the school should use source information when proposing shade near bus stops. Identify the strongest source, explain one limit or conflict, and compare it with at least one other source.

PART 1 • READ AND MARK

Underline each source's main claim, circle details that show credibility or limits, and write 1 beside each conflict, bias, or misconception you find. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 • ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What is the newspaper article's main idea, and what passage detail limits its citywide claim?	Its main idea is that shade can reduce heat exposure. Its citywide claim is limited because the field log measured only 20 bus stops at 3 p.m. on study days.
2	Which source is the strongest evidence for the temperature difference at Riverton bus stops? Give two details that make it credible or reliable.	The city public-health department field log is strongest. It includes trained staff, dates, locations, a stated method, and measurements from 20 bus stops.
3	Explain one conflict between the field log and the newspaper article.	The field log reports a 6-degree difference at selected bus stops during the study, while the article says planting trees would make every Riverton street six degrees cooler.
4	What shows that the nursery flyer may be biased and inaccurate? Name one limited purpose for which the flyer could still be useful.	The company sells trees, so its financial interest may create bias, and its claim has no measurements, dates, or research citation. It could still be useful for learning the company's prices or argument.

PART 3 • YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

The school should use the public-health field log as its strongest evidence when planning shade near bus stops. Its trained staff recorded temperatures with a stated method at named locations, although the results apply only to the measured stops and times. The newspaper article offers useful context but overstates the result, and the nursery flyer is less reliable because it makes an unsupported claim while selling trees.

Accept equivalent explanations that distinguish the primary field log from the secondary article and identify the flyer's financial interest and lack of evidence. In the open response, look for a supported recommendation, a stated limit or conflict, and a comparison of source usefulness or reliability.