

Evidence Under Shade

Evaluate sources and build a balanced research claim.

9.R.1 "Evaluation and Synthesis of Information Formulate and revise questions about a research topic, broadening or narrowing the inquiry as necessary. Gather and organize information from various sources, including internet resources..."

NAME _____

DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK _____ Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline each source claim or piece of evidence. Circle words or phrases that show a source's limit, point of view, or appropriate use.

Researching Cooler City Blocks

- ① At first, Maya asks, "Are trees good for cities?" Her librarian says the question is too broad to research well. Maya revises it: "How do street trees affect summer heat on blocks with little shade?" She gathers a city temperature map, a peer-reviewed study found through an electronic database, and a neighborhood group's website. The map shows afternoon surface temperatures, but it does not explain causes. The study compares shaded and unshaded streets in several cities. The group's site includes residents' photos and calls for more tree planting. Each source can help, but each has a different purpose and limit.
- ② Maya finds that the city map was published by the municipal environmental office and lists its measurement dates and methods. That information makes it useful for locating hot blocks, although one map cannot prove that trees caused a temperature difference. The database study names its authors, journal, sample cities, and data, so Maya treats it as strong evidence about the relationship between shade and heat. The neighborhood group has a clear point of view: it wants funding for trees. Its photos show local concerns, yet its claim that every block can be cooled quickly is not supported with measurements. Maya records both evidence and limits in a chart.
- ③ A landscaping company's report argues that planting and caring for trees costs money and water, especially during drought. This counterclaim does not erase Maya's evidence, but it changes her developing claim. She writes that city leaders should plant trees first on the hottest, least shaded blocks while planning for watering and maintenance. She cites the map and study for paraphrased facts and identifies the group's website when describing residents' views. An AI search summary helps her find possible keywords, but she does not treat it as evidence. She opens the original sources, checks the summary against them, and never presents AI wording as her own.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE _____ Use the passage

1 How does Maya’s revised question make her research inquiry more focused than her first question?

2 Why is the city temperature map useful but not enough by itself to prove that trees cause cooler temperatures?

3 How does the neighborhood group’s point of view affect the way Maya should use its website?

4 What is Maya’s final claim, and what counterclaim does she need to address?

3 YOUR TURN _____ Your own words

Choose a local issue, such as later school start times or safe bike routes. Write 3 to 4 sentences: revise a broad question into a focused research question, name two sources you would check and explain what makes each useful or limited, then state a possible claim and counterclaim. Include an MLA-style in-text citation for one paraphrased fact, using a placeholder author or organization name if needed.

PART 1 • READ AND MARK

Underline each source claim or piece of evidence. Circle words or phrases that show a source's limit, point of view, or appropriate use. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 • ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	How does Maya's revised question make her research inquiry more focused than her first question?	It narrows the topic from whether trees are good for all cities to how street trees affect summer heat on blocks with little shade.
2	Why is the city temperature map useful but not enough by itself to prove that trees cause cooler temperatures?	It helps locate hot blocks and gives measurement dates and methods, but it shows temperatures only and does not prove the cause of a temperature difference.
3	How does the neighborhood group's point of view affect the way Maya should use its website?	Because the group wants funding for trees, its photos are useful for showing residents' concerns, but its claim that every block can be cooled quickly needs evidence because it has no measurements.
4	What is Maya's final claim, and what counterclaim does she need to address?	Her claim is that leaders should plant trees first on the hottest, least shaded blocks while planning for watering and maintenance. The counterclaim is that planting and caring for trees costs money and water, especially during drought.

PART 3 • YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

Instead of asking whether later starts are better, I would ask, "How might an 8:30 a.m. high school start affect students' sleep and bus schedules in our district?" I would use the American Academy of Pediatrics policy statement because it explains health recommendations, and I would use a district transportation report because it could show local bus limits, though each source may not predict our students' exact experience. I might claim that the district should consider later high school starts because the academy recommends start times of 8:30 a.m. or later for middle and high schools (American Academy of Pediatrics), while a counterclaim is that changing bus routes could cost more.

Accept equivalent explanations that use passage evidence about source purpose, evidence, limitations, and point of view. For Part 3, accept varied local issues when the response includes a focused question, two evaluated sources, a claim, a counterclaim, and an appropriate in-text citation.