Evidence Before Claims

Evaluate sources before building a research claim.

9.R.1 "Evaluation and Synthesis of Information Formulate and revise questions about a research topic, broadening or narrowing the inquiry as necessary. Gather and organize information from various sources, including internet resources..."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline Maya's claim and counterclaim, circle each source she uses, and number the details that show why a source needs evaluation before it is used.

Investigating a Later Bell

1 At Riverton High, Maya investigates whether a later first bell could help students. Her first question, "Are later school starts better?" is too broad. After reading the American Academy of Pediatrics recommendation that middle and high schools start at 8:30 a.m. or later, she revises it: "How might an 8:30 start affect sleep and attendance at Riverton High?" The new question names a group and two outcomes. Maya saves a link to the academy statement, searches an education database for peer-reviewed sleep studies, and requests the school's attendance records.

2 One database article reports that later starts are associated with more sleep, but it studied students in several districts, not Riverton alone. The academy statement is a secondary source that summarizes research and gives a professional recommendation. Riverton's attendance records are a primary source for local absences, although they cannot prove why an absence occurred. A transportation director's memo warns that a later bell could require new bus routes and cost more. Maya notes this point of view because the director manages transportation, yet she checks whether the memo includes cost evidence.

3 Her draft claim says a later start may improve student sleep and deserves local study. She introduces a counterclaim: changing bus schedules may raise costs or affect family routines. Rather than treating either idea as certain, Maya compares the studies, records, and memo, looking for agreement and conflict. In her notes, she puts quotation marks around exact words and records each source's author, title, date, and link for MLA citations. If an AI tool suggests search terms or summarizes a source, she verifies the original source, credits any ideas she uses, and never presents copied writing as her own. Plagiarism can bring school consequences and may violate copyright.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. What is Maya's revised research question, and what makes it narrower than her first question?

2. Which source is a primary source for local absences? What is one limit of that source?

3. What counterclaim does Maya include, and which source raises that concern?

4. Name two actions Maya takes to use sources ethically, including when she uses AI.

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Choose a school issue you want to investigate. Write a narrowed research question, then name two sources you would seek, label each as primary or secondary, and give one credibility or usefulness check for each. Add a tentative claim, a counterclaim, and one ethical way to use AI during your research.

ANSWER KEY

Evidence Before Claims

GRADE 9 · 9.R.1

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline Maya's claim and counterclaim, circle each source she uses, and number the details that show why a source needs evaluation before it is used. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What is Maya's revised research question, and what makes it narrower than her first question?	**"How might an 8:30 start affect sleep and attendance at Riverton High?" It is narrower because it names one school group and two specific outcomes, sleep and attendance.**
2	Which source is a primary source for local absences? What is one limit of that source?	**Riverton's attendance records are the primary source. They show local absences but cannot prove why an absence occurred.**
3	What counterclaim does Maya include, and which source raises that concern?	**The counterclaim is that changing bus schedules may raise costs or affect family routines. The transportation director's memo raises the concern.**
4	Name two actions Maya takes to use sources ethically, including when she uses AI.	**She records source information for MLA citations and uses quotation marks for exact words. When AI helps, she verifies the original source and credits ideas she uses instead of presenting copied writing as her own.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

My narrowed question is, "How could Riverton High reduce unopened food thrown away during lunch?" I would request the cafeteria's weekly waste-weighing logs, a primary source, and check whether staff used the same scale and procedure each week. I would use a review article about school food-share programs, a secondary source, and check its author, date, and cited evidence. My tentative claim is that a share table could reduce unopened waste. A counterclaim is that food-safety rules may limit which items can be shared. If AI suggests search terms, I will verify sources myself and cite the sources I use.

Accept equivalent explanations that accurately distinguish the passage's source types, limits, points of view, and ethical practices. For the open task, accept reasonable school issues when the student includes all requested research-planning elements and a claim that differs from the counterclaim.