

Two Texts, One Idea

A reflective comparison model

9.W.1.B "Write reflectively in response to readings in which students compare two or more texts with details, examples, and other textual evidence to support an idea or position."

NAME _____

DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK _____ Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline one detail from each text that supports the writer's comparison, and circle two places where the writer connects the reading to personal thinking. These marks show how evidence and reflection work together.

Responsibility in Two Forms

- ① After reading the short story "The Last Lantern" and the poem "Platform at Dawn," I kept thinking about responsibility when no one is watching. In the story, Mara finds a lantern beside a flooded footbridge and stays to guide neighbors across. The narrator says she holds the light "until the rain thins and the last bicycle reaches dry pavement." In the poem, the speaker waits alone after seeing an older traveler drop a paper map. Instead of calling out immediately, the speaker watches the map skitter toward the tracks, then runs after it. Both moments show a choice to help, but the writers make that choice feel different.
- ② Although both texts value helping a stranger, the story presents responsibility as steady public work. Mara remains at the bridge while other people cross, so her action protects a whole neighborhood. The poem makes responsibility more private and uncertain. Its speaker admits, "I counted three breaths before I moved," which reveals hesitation rather than instant courage. I relate more to the speaker because I have delayed speaking up when I was unsure whether my help would matter. Still, Mara's patience challenges me to see that useful actions may require time as well as good intentions.
- ③ The different forms also shape my response. The story uses a narrator who follows Mara through the rain, so I can picture the bridge, the bicycles, and the people depending on her. That concrete scene makes responsibility seem visible. The poem uses short first-person lines and pauses, including the speaker's "three breaths." Because I have felt that pause before acting, the poem makes the decision feel closer to my own life. Together, the texts changed my idea that responsibility means being fearless. I now think it can mean noticing a need, admitting doubt, and choosing to act anyway.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE _____ Use the passage

1 What shared idea does the writer find in both texts? Give one supporting detail from “The Last Lantern” and one from “Platform at Dawn.”

2 How does the writer contrast the kind of responsibility shown in each text? Use evidence from the passage.

3 How do the two genres affect the writer’s response? Compare one feature of the story with one feature of the poem.

4 What position does the writer reach about responsibility after comparing the texts? Explain how both texts help develop that position.

3 YOUR TURN _____ Your own words

Choose two texts you have read. Write a 100 to 130 word reflective comparison that states an idea or position, includes one specific detail from each text, and explains how the comparison connects to your thinking or experience.

PART 1 • READ AND MARK

Underline one detail from each text that supports the writer's comparison, and circle two places where the writer connects the reading to personal thinking. These marks show how evidence and reflection work together. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 • ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What shared idea does the writer find in both texts? Give one supporting detail from "The Last Lantern" and one from "Platform at Dawn."	Both texts show people choosing to help when no one requires them to. Mara guides neighbors across a flooded bridge, and the poem's speaker runs after an older traveler's map.
2	How does the writer contrast the kind of responsibility shown in each text? Use evidence from the passage.	The story shows public, steady responsibility because Mara protects many neighbors at the bridge. The poem shows private, uncertain responsibility because the speaker pauses for "three breaths" before acting.
3	How do the two genres affect the writer's response? Compare one feature of the story with one feature of the poem.	The story's narrated rain scene lets the writer picture the bridge and the people relying on Mara. The poem's first-person lines and pauses make the speaker's hesitation feel closer to the writer's own experience.
4	What position does the writer reach about responsibility after comparing the texts? Explain how both texts help develop that position.	The writer concludes that responsibility does not require fearlessness. Mara shows patient action, while the poem's hesitant speaker shows that a person can admit doubt and still choose to help.

PART 3 • YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

Reading Lois Lowry's *The Giver* beside Kurt Vonnegut's "Harrison Bergeron" made me question whether safety is worth giving up choice. In *The Giver*, the community removes pain by controlling memories, and Jonas learns the truth when the Giver transfers memories to him. In "Harrison Bergeron," the government uses handicaps to force everyone to seem equal, even interrupting Harrison's strength and intelligence. Both societies claim to protect people, but Lowry focuses on a boy's growing awareness while Vonnegut uses exaggeration that feels frightening and absurd. I used to think fewer choices might make life calmer. These texts convinced me that people need freedom to make meaningful decisions.

Accept equivalent comparisons when students support them with accurate details from both texts. In the open response, look for a clear position, meaningful evidence from each text, comparison, and reflection rather than plot summary alone.