

Draft Detectives

Evaluate a proposal for clear, useful information.

9.W.3.B "Use peer- and self-evaluation to edit writing for clarity and quality of information, addressing strengths and making suggestions regarding how writing might be improved."

NAME _____

DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK _____ Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline one detail that makes the proposal stronger, circle one claim that needs more evidence, and number two revision suggestions the writer already gives. These marks will help you evaluate clarity and quality of information.

A Refill Station Proposal

- ① Our school could reduce waste by adding a water-refill station near the gym. During one Tuesday lunch period, I counted 37 students carrying disposable drink bottles as they left the cafeteria. That snapshot does not show every student's habits, but it suggests that convenient refill locations might matter. The nearest fountain is down a crowded hall, and its line often slows students between classes. A refill station would let students fill reusable bottles quickly. It would also make water easier to reach after physical education and team practices.
- ② Before choosing a model, the student council should collect better information. The principal's office can provide the school's water-use rules, and the facilities manager can explain where plumbing connections are possible. A station also has costs beyond the purchase price, including installation, filter replacement, cleaning, and repairs. The proposal says the station will pay for itself soon, but it does not state a price, a savings estimate, or a time frame. Comparing two models in a table would help readers see their bottle-filling speed, filter needs, warranty, and total cost.
- ③ Students could help the council test whether the station would be useful. For five school days, volunteers could record how many people use the nearby fountain at lunch and after school. They could also ask a short anonymous survey question: "Would you use a refill station near the gym?" The draft should explain how many students answered and when the survey occurred. Its final paragraph repeats that the project is important, yet readers already know that claim. Instead, the ending should name the next decision, such as requesting price quotes or presenting findings to the school board.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE _____ Use the passage

1 Which detail in paragraph 1 is a strength because it is specific but does not overstate what it proves? Explain why.

2 Identify the claim in paragraph 2 that needs more evidence. What three pieces of information should the writer add?

3 What information should readers compare in a table before choosing a refill-station model?

4 What is one clear revision the writer should make to the final paragraph, and why?

3 YOUR TURN _____ Your own words

Write a 90-120 word proposal for one improvement at your school. Then write two review notes: identify one strength in your draft and suggest one specific way to improve its clarity or quality of information.

PART 1 • READ AND MARK

Underline one detail that makes the proposal stronger, circle one claim that needs more evidence, and number two revision suggestions the writer already gives. These marks will help you evaluate clarity and quality of information. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 • ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	Which detail in paragraph 1 is a strength because it is specific but does not overstate what it proves? Explain why.	The count of 37 students carrying disposable bottles is specific, and the writer admits that one lunch-period snapshot does not show every student's habits.
2	Identify the claim in paragraph 2 that needs more evidence. What three pieces of information should the writer add?	The claim that the station will pay for itself soon needs evidence. Add a price, a savings estimate, and a time frame.
3	What information should readers compare in a table before choosing a refill-station model?	Bottle-filling speed, filter needs, warranty, and total cost.
4	What is one clear revision the writer should make to the final paragraph, and why?	Replace the repeated statement that the project is important with the next decision, such as requesting price quotes or presenting findings, because readers already know the project is important.

PART 3 • YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

Our school should add a covered waiting area beside the bus loop. On rainy afternoons, students currently stand along the sidewalk while they wait for buses. During a five-day count, I would record how many students wait there and how long they wait. I would also ask the transportation office whether the location keeps bus doors and sidewalks clear. Before the school selects a design, it should compare the cost, size, drainage needs, and maintenance plans of two shelters. This information would help leaders decide whether a shelter solves a documented problem at a reasonable cost. Strength: The draft gives a clear location and a plan to collect usage data. Suggestion: Add an estimated price range or funding source so readers can judge cost more clearly.

Accept equivalent strengths that identify specific, useful evidence and explain its value. Accept revision suggestions that add needed evidence, clarify a vague claim, improve organization, or remove repetition.