

Constitutional Trade-Offs

Compare the plans and compromises that shaped the new government.

CE.1.c "comparing and contrasting debates, compromises, and plans surrounding the drafting and ratification of the Constitution of the United States and the Bill of Rights;"

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK _____ Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline each plan or compromise, circle the group or concern it addressed, and write 1 beside drafting ideas and 2 beside ratification ideas so you can compare their purposes.

Building Agreement

- ① In 1787, delegates met in Philadelphia because the Articles of Confederation gave the national government too little power to solve trade, debt, and security problems. They agreed that a new plan was needed, but they disagreed about representation in Congress. The Virginia Plan favored a powerful national government with representation based on population. Larger states supported it because their populations would give them more votes. The New Jersey Plan called for equal representation for each state, protecting the influence of smaller states.
- ② The Great Compromise combined parts of both plans. It created a Congress with two houses: the House of Representatives, where representation depends on population, and the Senate, where every state has two senators. Delegates also argued about counting enslaved people when seats and taxes were divided among states. The Three-Fifths Compromise counted three fifths of a state's enslaved population for those purposes. These agreements helped delegates finish the Constitution, yet they did not end the conflicts or make the document fair to everyone.
- ③ Before the Constitution could take effect, nine states had to ratify it. Federalists supported ratification, arguing that the new system could provide order, defense, and a workable national government. Anti-Federalists feared that the federal government would become too powerful and that the Constitution did not clearly protect individual liberties. To answer this concern, Federalists promised amendments. After the Constitution was ratified in 1788, Congress proposed the Bill of Rights. Ratified in 1791, its first ten amendments limited government power and protected freedoms such as speech, religion, and fair legal treatment.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE _____ Use the passage

1 How did the Virginia Plan and the New Jersey Plan differ in their ideas about representation in Congress?

2 How did the Great Compromise combine ideas from both the Virginia Plan and the New Jersey Plan?

3 What did the Three-Fifths Compromise count, and for what two purposes was it used?

4 Compare the Federalists' and Anti-Federalists' views of ratification. How did the Bill of Rights respond to the Anti-Federalists' concern?

3 YOUR TURN _____ Your own words

Write four sentences comparing the Great Compromise with the Bill of Rights. Explain one similarity, one difference, and how each helped gain support for the new Constitution.

PART 1 • READ AND MARK

Underline each plan or compromise, circle the group or concern it addressed, and write 1 beside drafting ideas and 2 beside ratification ideas so you can compare their purposes. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 • ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	How did the Virginia Plan and the New Jersey Plan differ in their ideas about representation in Congress?	The Virginia Plan based representation on population, while the New Jersey Plan gave every state equal representation.
2	How did the Great Compromise combine ideas from both the Virginia Plan and the New Jersey Plan?	It created a House of Representatives based on population and a Senate in which every state has two senators.
3	What did the Three-Fifths Compromise count, and for what two purposes was it used?	It counted three fifths of a state's enslaved population for dividing seats and taxes among states.
4	Compare the Federalists' and Anti-Federalists' views of ratification. How did the Bill of Rights respond to the Anti-Federalists' concern?	Federalists supported ratification because they wanted order, defense, and a workable national government. Anti-Federalists feared a federal government that was too powerful and did not protect liberties. The Bill of Rights limited government power and protected individual freedoms.

PART 3 • YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

The Great Compromise and the Bill of Rights both responded to disagreements that threatened support for the Constitution. The Great Compromise settled a drafting conflict by giving large states influence in the House and small states equal power in the Senate. The Bill of Rights answered Anti-Federalist fears during ratification by protecting individual liberties and limiting government power. One compromise organized representation in Congress, while the other helped build trust in the new government.

Accept equivalent comparisons that accurately distinguish drafting disagreements from ratification concerns. For the open response, accept a clear four-sentence comparison that includes a similarity, a difference, and the role each measure played in building support.