

One Vote, Three Views

Compare accounts to explain why sources may differ.

CE.9.f "evaluating multiple sources describing the same event or idea and reflecting on the reasons for any discrepancies."

NAME _____

DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK _____ Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline details that sources agree on, circle details that differ or are missing, and number 1, 2, or 3 beside clues about a source's purpose, audience, or chosen evidence.

A Change in Public Comment

- ① On April 18, the Riverton City Council voted 5 to 2 to move its public comment period from the end of meetings to the beginning. The change began with the May meeting. A city news release said the goal was to help residents speak before late-night agenda items. It also stated that each speaker would still receive three minutes. The release was written by the city communications office, which works for the council and describes official policy.
- ② The next day, the Riverton Gazette reported that the council "cut public comment" and that several people left before the meeting ended. Its reporter interviewed two residents who attended and quoted one who preferred the old schedule. The article did not say that the three-minute limit remained. Because the reporter focused on people disappointed by the change, the article gave readers a different impression from the city release. Both sources described the same vote, but they selected different details and used different language to explain its importance.
- ③ To check the accounts, a student read the official meeting minutes and watched the public video. The minutes recorded the 5 to 2 vote and the new time for comments. The video showed that speakers who signed up received three minutes, although the meeting ran late and some residents did leave. The city release was strongest for the exact rule, while the Gazette was useful for reactions. Differences among sources do not always mean that one source is false. Purpose, audience, and chosen evidence can cause discrepancies.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE _____ Use the passage

1 Which two sources confirm that speakers still received three minutes? What does this agreement show?

2 What important detail did the Riverton Gazette leave out? How could leaving it out affect readers?

3 Why did the Gazette give a different impression of the vote than the city news release?

4 Which source was strongest for finding the exact new rule about public comment? Use evidence from the passage to explain your choice.

3 YOUR TURN _____ Your own words

Create two possible source accounts of a school board decision. Write four sentences: name the decision, explain what one source emphasizes, explain what a second source emphasizes, and explain why the accounts could differ and what source you would check.

PART 1 • READ AND MARK

Underline details that sources agree on, circle details that differ or are missing, and number 1, 2, or 3 beside clues about a source's purpose, audience, or chosen evidence. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 • ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	Which two sources confirm that speakers still received three minutes? What does this agreement show?	The city news release and the public video confirm the three-minute limit. Their agreement supports the claim that the limit remained.
2	What important detail did the Riverton Gazette leave out? How could leaving it out affect readers?	The Gazette left out that each speaker still had three minutes. Readers might think public comment time was reduced or removed.
3	Why did the Gazette give a different impression of the vote than the city news release?	The Gazette focused on disappointed residents, selected their reactions, and used the words “cut public comment.” The city release focused on the purpose and official rule.
4	Which source was strongest for finding the exact new rule about public comment? Use evidence from the passage to explain your choice.	The city news release was strongest because it described the official policy and stated that speakers would still receive three minutes. The meeting minutes and video also supported key details.

PART 3 • YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

At a school board meeting, members voted to require student IDs at football games. The school newsletter says the rule will help staff identify guests quickly. A student newspaper quotes students who think the rule could slow the entrance line. The accounts differ because each source chose evidence for a different audience, so I would check the meeting minutes for the exact rule.

Accept answers that distinguish confirmed facts from reactions or omitted information and connect discrepancies to purpose, audience, wording, or selected evidence. For the open response, accept any plausible school board decision if the student compares two sources and names a useful source to check.