

One Policy, Two Views

Compare cultural, economic, political, and historical perspectives on a New Deal policy.

S.WG.e "comparing and contrasting historical, cultural, economic, and political perspectives;"

NAME _____

DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK _____ Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline phrases that show the Navajo families' perspective, and circle phrases that show the federal officials' perspective. Write 1 by cultural evidence, 2 by economic evidence, and 3 by political evidence so you can compare the views.

Livestock Reduction on the Navajo Nation

- ① During the 1930s, the United States government began the Navajo livestock reduction program on the Navajo Nation. Officials believed that too many sheep and goats were damaging grasslands and causing soil erosion. The program grew from New Deal conservation policies during the Great Depression. Federal agents set limits on herds and arranged for many animals to be sold or killed. The policy affected a people whose economy, family life, and traditions had long been connected to raising livestock.
- ② Many Navajo families saw sheep as more than property. Wool could be woven into rugs, animals provided food, and herds represented security and independence. Families often judged the program through a cultural and economic perspective: losing animals meant losing income and a valued way of life. Some also objected that federal officials made major decisions with too little Navajo consent. To them, the policy showed political power being used over their community rather than with it.
- ③ Federal officials emphasized a different economic and political view. They argued that smaller herds could protect the land and support its future use. They also believed federal conservation experts should direct the plan. Both groups cared about the land and about survival during hard economic times, but they disagreed about who should decide and what losses were acceptable. Later historians use Navajo accounts alongside government records to show that one policy could carry sharply different meanings.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE _____ Use the passage

1 How did Navajo families' cultural and economic view of livestock differ from the federal officials' economic view?

2 Contrast the political perspectives of Navajo families and federal officials about who should make decisions.

3 What concern did both Navajo families and federal officials share?

4 What can later historians understand by using Navajo accounts alongside government records?

3 YOUR TURN _____ Your own words

Imagine a city plans to build a solar farm on land used for an annual community festival. Write five sentences comparing the city council's perspective with the festival organizers' perspective. Include one cultural or historical reason, one economic or political reason, one similarity or difference, and who holds decision-making power.

PART 1 • READ AND MARK

Underline phrases that show the Navajo families' perspective, and circle phrases that show the federal officials' perspective. Write 1 by cultural evidence, 2 by economic evidence, and 3 by political evidence so you can compare the views. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 • ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	How did Navajo families' cultural and economic view of livestock differ from the federal officials' economic view?	Navajo families connected livestock to rugs, food, income, security, and a valued way of life. Officials argued that smaller herds would protect the land and support its future use.
2	Contrast the political perspectives of Navajo families and federal officials about who should make decisions.	Some Navajo families believed officials acted with too little Navajo consent. Officials believed federal conservation experts should direct the plan.
3	What concern did both Navajo families and federal officials share?	Both cared about the land and about survival during hard economic times.
4	What can later historians understand by using Navajo accounts alongside government records?	They can understand that the same livestock reduction policy had sharply different meanings for Navajo families and federal officials.

PART 3 • YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

The festival organizers oppose the solar farm because the field has hosted their celebration for generations. This historical and cultural connection makes the land important to them. The city council supports the project because it could create jobs and produce electricity. Both groups want the community to thrive, but they disagree about the field's best use. The city council has political power to approve the plan, although organizers can speak at meetings.

Accept paraphrased responses that accurately identify and compare the perspectives stated in the passage. For the open task, accept varied positions when the response includes the required perspective-based comparison and identifies decision-making power.